# Research in management accounting innovations

Management accounting innovations

505

# An overview of its recent development

Nur Haiza Muhammad Zawawi

Department of Accounting and Finance, University of Malaysia Terengganu, Kuala Terengganu, Malaysia and School of Accounting, La Trobe University, Melbourne, Australia, and

# Zahirul Hoque

School of Accounting, La Trobe University, Melbourne, Australia

#### **Abstract**

Purpose – The purpose of paper is to present a review of the literature on management accounting innovations (MAIs). Specifically, it explores recent developments in research on MAIs and offers suggestions for future research. The review differs from existing reviews by its specific focus on MAIs and the recent time period covered. In this paper, MAIs refer to the adoption of "newer" or modern forms of management accounting systems such as activity-based costing (ABC), activity-based management, time-driven ABC, target costing, and balanced scorecards.

Design/methodology/approach - The paper presents a review of findings from journal articles published in 22 notable accounting journals.

Findings – The review finds that research on MAIs has intensified during the period 2000-2008, with the main focus on exploring the extent to which a host of organizational and environmental factors influence the implementation and use of MAIs in organizations. In addition, research on MAIs indicates the dominant use of sociological theories and increasing use of empirical/field studies.

**Research limitations/implications** – A literature review using a given set of accounting journals and search words used to identify relevant articles may overlook literature within the scope of the review. The paper concludes the importance of more research on MAIs by offering some directions for future research.

Originality/value - The paper's specific focus on MAIs and the recent time period offer the reader useful insights on management accounting research and theory.

Keywords Management accounting, Innovation, Accounting research

Paper type General review

#### 1. Introduction

A considerable number of scholars have conducted reviews on management accounting and control research, within a particular timeframe and scope[1]. The purpose of this paper is to extend these reviews, particularly by Hesford et al. (2007), Ittner and Larcker (1998b), Otley et al. (1995), Scapens and Bromwich (2001), Selto and Widener (2004), Shields (1997) and Young and Selto (1991). Building upon these reviews in general, and more specifically Shields' (1997) analytical framework, this paper reports findings from Qualitative Research in Accounting &

The authors thank participants of the 2nd New Zealand Management Accounting Conference, 20-21 November 2008, for their useful comments. They are also grateful to the Editor and the two anonymous reviewers for their helpful and constructive comments.

Management Vol. 7 No. 4, 2010 pp. 505-568 © Emerald Group Publishing Limited 1176-6093 DOI 10.1108/11766091011094554



a literature search of the use of management accounting innovations (MAIs). The paper explores recent developments in research on MAIs and presents suggestions for future research. Table I summarizes the attributes of existing reviews and illustrates how the current review differs from existing reviews by its specific focus on MAIs and the recent time period covered.

Table I gives that Young and Selto (1991) reviewed empirical research on cost management topics published prior to 1990. Their review centered around a framework that outlines several interrelated variables in order to explain the productivity paradox. Otley *et al.* (1995) presented research on management control systems (MCS) covering the period between 1954 and 1995. They focused on the MCS literature and categorized various managerial aspects into closed or open systems and rational or natural systems perspectives. Ittner and Larcker (1998b) captured the trend of research on performance measurement innovations such as economic value measures, non-financial measures, and performance measurement initiatives in government agencies prior to 1997. They selected articles that were mainly based on surveys conducted by consulting firms and government agencies.

Selto and Widener (2004) presented wider coverage, but limited themselves to articles on conventional management accounting topics and topics that are prominent in professional finance and accounting literatures. Their review involved 14 management and accounting research journals and seven professional magazines and journals, in order to identify the divergence between management accounting research topics and practice issues. Other reviews, however, did not rely on a specific area of management accounting. For example, Shields' (1997) review focused on articles published by North Americans during the period of 1990-1996. His review was confined to only to six leading academic accounting journals[2].

Scapens and Bromwich (2001) explored research published in *Management Accounting Research* (*MAR*) journal between 1990 and 1999. They also briefly compared the state of the research of those articles to the North American papers reviewed by Shields (1997). Hesford *et al.* (2007) analyzed management accounting articles in ten journals published between 1981 and 2000. They observed the evolution of the research in this field and examined the articles' citations to reveal the influential individuals, topics, methods, and sources of disciplines.

Overall, the above existing reviews have provided an overview of the state of the management accounting literature and encapsulated the research done in the past towards identifying future directions. The earliest article was published in 1954, and was reviewed by Otley *et al.* (1995) and the latest is reviewed by Selto and Widener (2004) and Hesford *et al.* (2007), both of which concluded their reviews in 2000. The current review addresses the timeframe issue by including research on MAIs published until December 2008. As the business environment and technology are changing rapidly across the world, we believe that the time period between 2000 and 2008 could reveal many innovative accounting issues, hence, our coverage up to 2008.

In this paper, MAIs refer to the adoption of "newer" or modern forms of management accounting and control systems (MACS) such as activity-based costing (ABC), activity-based management (ABM), time-driven ABC, target costing, and balanced scorecards (BSC).

With regard to this definition, the term is generally equated with the newness of an idea. For example, Abernethy and Bouwens (2005) perceive MAIs as either new

Author	Title	Journal	Scope	Coverage	Timeframe
Young and Selto (1991)	New manufacturing practices and cost management: a review of the literature and directions for research	JAL	Modern cost management	Empirical study	Prior to 1991
Otley <i>et al.</i> (1995)	Research in management control: an overview of its	British Journal of Management	Management control	Literature which sees management control as	1954-1995
Shields (1997)	Research in management accounting by North	JMAR	General	practical activity of managers Research published by North Americans	1990-1997
Ittner and Larcker (1998h)	Innovations in performance measurement: trends and research implications	JMAR	Modern performance measures	Surveys by consulting firms and government organizations	Prior to 1998
Scapens and Bromwich (2001)	Management accounting research: the first decade	MAR	General	Research published in MAR, compared with Shields (1997)	1990-1999
and ner (2004)	New directions in management AMA accounting research: insights from practice	AMA	Conventional management accounting topics and prominent topics in professional finance and accounting literatura	Research journals and professional publications	1996-2000
Hesford <i>et al.</i> (2007)	Management accounting: a bibliographic study	Handbook of Management Accounting Research	General	Management accounting articles	1981-2000
Current review	Current review Research in management accounting innovations: an overview of its recent development	N/A	MAIs	Both qualitative and quantitative research	1926-2008

Table I. Summary of selected prior reviews

508

systems or the redesign of an existing system. Within innovation studies, the term requires different interpretations particularly when referring to organizational context. An innovation is perceived when it is invented or regarded as novel whether it is adopted or not (Zaltman *et al.*, 1973), or when an idea or procedure is first used (Becker and Whisler, 1967), implemented (Evan and Black, 1967), or becomes successful (Mohr, 1969).

Through this review, we intend to make an incremental contribution to the management accounting literature by exploring likely trends and the state of the research on MAIs. In the literature, there are existing reviews focusing on individual MAIs[3], therefore the current paper seeks to provide additional findings on specific MAIs practices as well as on the overall analysis of MAIs.

The rest of the paper is organized as follows. Section 2 outlines the review method used. Section 3 discusses the topics, research settings, research methods, theories and findings of the literature review. Finally, Section 4 provides concluding remarks and suggestions for future research.

#### 2. Review method

As given in Table II, the current review involves 22 leading accounting journals, namely, ABACUS, Accounting and Business Research (ABR), Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal (AAAJ), Accounting and Finance (AF), Accounting Horizon (AH), Accounting, Organizations and Society (AOS), Advances in Management Accounting (AMA), Behavioral Research in Accounting (BRIA), British Accounting Review (BAR), Contemporary Accounting Research (CAR), Critical Perspectives on Accounting (CPA), European Accounting Review (EAR), Journal of Accounting and Economics (JAE), Journal of Accounting & Organizational Change (JAOC), Journal of Accounting Education (JAED), Journal of Accounting Literature (JAL), Journal of Accounting Research (JAR), Journal of Cost Management/Cost Management (CM), Journal of Management Accounting Research (JMAR), MAR, Review of Accounting Studies (RAS), and The Accounting Review (TAR). These journals are widely accepted prestigious international refereed journals in the accounting field and articles published in them are subject to a rigorous, double blind review process.

The articles on MAIs were searched using the term "management accounting innovation". The search was targeted on the articles published in a number of online databases[4]. Table II reports the result of the database search. As can be seen from the table, the search found 666 articles on MAIs, published during the period of 1926-2008, both years inclusive[5].

For the purpose of the analysis, articles on financial accounting, corporate finance and research method topics, book reviews, and committee reports and discussions were omitted. The remaining articles were then examined to identify those that are centered on contemporary and specific formal techniques (Bisbe *et al.*, 2007), such as the BSC, benchmarking, ABC and ABM, total quality management (TQM), target costing, and value-chain management. For organizational and employees' performance measurement, selection was based on the use of non-financial measures or a combination of both financial and non-financial measures. Eventually, we identified 89 articles for further analysis, on the grounds that they are widely cited articles[6] and they are published in prestigious, international refereed journals. Further, these articles also represent topics within the scope of the paper, namely, MAIs. Research on MAIs falls

Management accounting innovations

509

Journals	Web site	Coverage	Articles retrieved from database search	Articles selected	Rank
ABACUS	$\label{eq:http://blackwellpublishing.com/journal.} http://blackwellpublishing.com/journal.$ asp?ref = 0001-3072	1965-2008	4	2	15
Accounting and Business Research <sup>a</sup>	www.abr-journal.com	1973-2008	2	Т	20
Accounting and Finance <sup>a</sup>	http://blackwell-synergy.com/loi/acfi	1979-2008	7	က	12
Accounting Horizons Accounting, Auditing &	http://aaahq.org/pubs/horizons.htm http://emeraldinsight.com/info/journals/aaaj/aaaj.	1987-2007	12	က	10
Accountability Journal	dsf	1988-2008	115	2	2
Accounting, Organizations and Society	http://elsevier.com/wps/product/cws_home/486	1976-2008	15	6	∞
Advances in Management Accounting <sup>a</sup>	http://info.emeraldinsight.com/products/books/ series.htm?id=1474-7871	2003-2007	4	က	16
Behavioral Research in	http://aaahq.org/abo/BRIA/BRIAHOME.HTM	5000	c	¢	Ţ
$Accounting^a$		1991-2008	D.	9	11
British Accounting Review <sup>a</sup> Contemporary Accounting	http://baa.group.shef.ac.uk/publications/bar.htm http://caaa.ca/CAR/	1988-2008	4	7	17
Research <sup>a</sup>		1991-2007	က	1	19
Critical Perspectives on Accounting	http://elsevier.com/wps/product/cws_home/622813	1990-2008	2	1	13
European Accounting Review Journal of Accounting &	http://eaa-online.org/r/default.asp?iId=JEKEJ http://info.emeraldinsight.com/products/iournals/	1992-2008	26	1	2
Organizational Change	journals.htm?id = jaoc	2005-2008	17	က	2
Journal of Accounting Education	http://elsevier.com/wps/product/cws_home/840	1983-2008	1	1	21
				(сои	(continued)

**Table II.** Database search results

510

Rank 18  $\mathbb{C}$ 9 14 Articles selected 2 16  $\Box$ Articles retrieved from database search 299 67 20 32 13 5 1996-2008 1926-2008 1963-2008 1992-2008 1993-2008 1982-2006 1992-2007 Coverage http://elsevier.com/wps/product/cws\_home/622911 http://springer.com/business/accounting/journal/ http://blackwellpublishing.com/journal. http://aaahq.org/mas/JMAR/JMAR.cfm http://cba.ufl.edu/fsoa/faculty/jal.asp http://ria.thomson.com/EStore/detail. http://aaahq.org/pubs/acctrev.htm asp?ref=0021-8456&site=1 aspx?ID=ZMCMP Web site Iournal of Management Accounting Iournal of Cost Management/Cost Iournal of Accounting Literature fournal of Accounting Research Review of Accounting Studies Management Accounting The Accounting Review Management<sup>a</sup> Research<sup>a</sup> Research<sup>a</sup> Journals

**Notes:** <sup>a</sup>As the search was conducted on journals published in online databases, earlier issues of some journals were not included; these journals are ABR (whose coverage starts from Volume 4 onwards), AF (Volume 19), AMA (Volume 11), BRIA (Volume 3), BAR (Volume 20), CAR (Volume 8), CM (Volume 6), IMAR (Volume 4) and MAR (Volume 4)

Table II.



Management

accounting

innovations

into two categories: first, research that focuses on MAIs in general; and second, research that focuses on a specific aspect of MAIs, such as ABC/ABM or the BSC.

Large numbers of articles found from the database searches are from *TAR*, *AAAJ*, *JAR*, and *EAR* journals, the top four ranked journals. However, relatively few of these were selected for the review. This is probably due to the implementation of the search operation of certain online databases that identify the articles when the words "management", "accounting", and "innovation" are found individually in the text. The journals *ABACUS*, *ABR*, *JAED*, *JAL*, *RAS*, and *CAR* appear to publish a very small number of articles on MAIs research. This seems to be, because these journals place more emphasis on quantitative and empirical studies and less on management accounting topics. However, other generalist accounting journals, such as *AOS*, *BRIA*, *JAOC*, and *AH*, place more equal weight on qualitative and quantitative management accounting research. They contain a relatively large number of articles in this area, with most of them reflecting the scope of MAIs defined earlier. With regard to the journals that pertain to other disciplines, *AF* seems to have some publications on MAIs, but none were found in *JAE*.

As expected, accounting journals specific to management accounting contain a larger number of MAIs studies. From the table, *JMAR* publishes more articles in this area than its counterpart, *MAR*. *JMAR* provides the largest number of articles selected for the review, as it tends to focus on performance measurement systems and activity-based systems topics. It was also found during the search that field research methods have been discussed and encouraged in *JMAR* (Ahrens and Dent, 1998; Baxter and Chua, 1998; Kaplan, 1998), although like other US-based journals, this journal is dominated by quantitative studies.

With regard to the practitioner journals, CM publishes more research on MAIs than AMA. Further, compared with the other journals, the articles from CM discuss more diverse management accounting practices, focusing on practical insights and experiences from case studies.

Appendix summarizes the attributes of the studies that form this review. The table in the Appendix comprises nine columns headed author/year, article title, journal, article type, key issues addressed, setting, theory, research method, and key findings. For the article type, articles were categorized according to whether they were a case study, empirical, experimental, descriptive, conceptual, practical insight, or review. Theories used by the researchers were based on the framework by Shields (1997): economic theories, psychological theories, sociological theories, organizational behavior theories, production and operations management theories, and strategic management theories. The classification of research methods is done following Shields (1997) of mathematical analytic, survey, archival, laboratory experimentation, case/field study, literature review, and multiple research methods.

# 3. Findings

This section discusses the findings from our literature review and briefly compares them with previous reviews. The topics, research settings, theoretical frameworks, methods used, and results in the sample articles are summarized and analyzed.

## 3.1 Topics

As mentioned above, the articles for the review are categorized into two groups: MAIs in general; and MAIs as specific practices. Table III reports the frequency of topics in



QRAM 7.4	Topics	Frequenc	су
,	MAIs in general		18
	MACS		63
	Organizational/manufacturing performance measures	17	
	Employees' performance measures	11	
512	ABC and activity-based cost management	19	
012	Balanced-scorecard	8	
	Strategic management accounting	3	
	Value-based management	3	
	Benchmarking	1	
	Target costing	1	
	Operations management		8
	TQM	5	
	Lean manufacturing	2	
Table III.	Supply chain management	1	
Distribution of topics	Total		89

the articles, which gives that 18 articles are on management accounting practices as a whole, while 71 are specific to 11 practices of MACS and operations management.

As can be seen from Table III, the reviewed articles are dominated by research on the innovation of MACS. Research within this area concentrated on non-financial measures of organizational and manufacturing performance measurement (17 articles), employees' performance measures (11), and ABC and ABM (19). Other contemporary techniques of MACS in the reviewed articles are BSC (eight), strategic management accounting (three), value-based management (three), benchmarking (one), and target costing (one). The articles on operations management include TQM (five), lean manufacturing (two), and supply chain management (one).

While Shields (1997) found few articles on non-financial performance measures, the current review observed an increase in research in those areas, especially in and following 1998. This is consistent with Hesford *et al.* (2007), which reported significant shifts in the control literature from budgeting and organizational control to performance measurement and evaluation topics. We find that, in the sampled articles, studies from earlier years generally discuss the importance and performance consequences of non-financial measures. In more recent years, research tends to examine the way in which non-financial measures are being designed and used to improve performance (Banker *et al.*, 2000; Bouwens and van Lent, 2006; Burney and Widener, 2007; Cavalluzzo and Ittner, 2004; Chenhall, 2003, 2005).

Research on ABC/ABM received considerable attention and concentrated on implementation and contextual issues such as top management's support and resource constraints (Agbejule, 2006; Al-Omiri and Drury, 2007; Argyris and Kaplan, 1994; Baird, 2007; Briers and Chua, 2001; Chenhall, 2004). Our review also reveals an inconclusive debate on the mixed results in previous studies regarding the adoption of ABC/ABM, despite their widely claimed benefits. The articles under review attempted to identify various variables that are associated with the adoption, use, and effectiveness of ABC/ABM. Recently, Kaplan and Anderson (2007) introduced a new innovation of ABC, namely time-driven ABC to overcome the subjectivity and complexity of conventional ABC. In their revised model, time is used to drive costs directly from resources to cost

objects, thus skipping the activity-definition stage and allocation of resource costs to activities in conventional ABC (Kaplan and Anderson, 2007). However, empirical study is needed to provide evidence on the applicability and benefits of this new model.

In contrast to ABC/ABM, the other innovation by Kaplan and Norton (1992, 1996a, b, 2001), the BSC, has been much less researched. This may be because its application does not explicitly indicate the use of BSC, but the use of financial and non-financial information or, by other terms. According to Malmi (2001), the determination of a measurement system as a BSC is always far from clear. The BSC has similar attributes to France's Tableaux de Bord (Lebas, 1994), and is often supplemented with other management techniques (Ax and Bjørnenak, 2005). Researchers usually presume a BSC when it involves both financial and non-financial measures; however, France's Tableaux de Bord also constitutes the same elements of performance measures. The distinctive features of the BSC are that it should contain some version of the original four perspectives: built from financial and non-financial measures, the measures are derived from organizational strategy and impose cause-and-effect relationships (Chenhall, 2005; Malmi, 2001).

Overall, the current review agrees with Shields (1997) that recent research tends to extend the topics that have already been studied. Researchers are inclined to focus on popular tools in MACS, which could lead to lack of diversity in the topics being studied. In the current review, it is noted that research in value-based management, benchmarking, life cycle costing, and target costing have received little attention in management accounting research (Hesford *et al.*, 2007; Selto and Widener, 2004; Shields, 1997). Perhaps, an extensive review that provides more coverage of published articles could be conducted for future research to verify this inference.

Despite the continuing concern about the correspondence of management accounting practices to manufacturing technology, not many studies incorporate discussion of different operations management techniques in accounting journals. TQM and just-in-time (JIT) are common operations management techniques tested in management accounting literature, whereas lean manufacturing, supply chain management, business process reengineering and theory of constraints are relatively rarely discussed. Ittner and Larcker (2001) suggest that research on the interface between accounting and operations management has been substantially reduced due to increased interest in "new" topics such as BSC, intangible assets, and economic value added. This underdeveloped body of research means that many research topics are as yet unexplored, and conflicting results remain unresolved (Ittner and Larcker, 2001).

### 3.2 Settings

Table IV reports the distribution of research settings in the sampled articles. The classification of the settings is based on Shields (1997). From the table, research in MAIs is centered on the manufacturing industry (29 articles), comprising the production and services activities of manufacturing companies. Another single industry setting is services (six) which comprises retailing, banking, financial services, hotels, and health care, whereas specific industry (two) comprises telecommunications and the airline industries.

The 13 studies that were conducted in multiple industries almost exclusively involve survey and archival methods. Six studies were conducted in the public sector and nine employed generic settings[7]. Research in inter-organizational, international,



QRAM 7,4	Topics	Frequency
,	Single industry	
	Manufacturing	29
	Service	6
	Specific industry	2
514	Multiple industries	13
011	Generic	9
	Public sector	6
	Inter-organizational	2
	International	1
	Multinationals	1
	Specific country	1
Table IV.	No setting or other settings	19
Distribution of settings	Total	89

and multinational companies are not well represented in this sample, consistent with Shields (1997). The 19 studies that do not involve research settings are conceptual/practice-oriented papers.

Heavy emphasis on the manufacturing industry is consistent with the traditional involvement of management accounting practices (Scapens and Bromwich, 2001; Shields, 1997). Studies in manufacturing settings mainly related to cost management and management control such as ABC and ABM, performance measures and quality-related measures as well as operations management tools (Agbejule, 2006; Chenhall, 2004). Further, the current review shows that research on MAIs places similar emphasis on non-manufacturing settings. Performance measurement initiatives and ABM are widely studied in service industry and public sector organizations (Cavalluzzo and Ittner, 2004; Hussain and Hoque, 2002; Lapsley and Wright, 2004; Webb, 2004). This indicates that innovations of management accounting are also applicable to non-manufacturing settings, which might be explained by the high intensity of competitive pressures in the service industry (Hussain and Hoque, 2002) and public sector reform (Lapsley and Wright, 2004).

#### 3.3 Theories

Table V provides the distribution of theories used in the articles reviewed. There are 18 articles which are based on sociological theories, 13 articles based on economic theory, 11 articles on contingency theory, and nine articles based on organizational behavior perspectives. Other articles rely on production and operations management (two articles), strategic management (one), psychology (one), or a combination of multiple theories (13). The remaining two articles are based on Simon's levers of control.

Within these 89 articles, there are a number that do not explicitly indicate the theory used; with most of them developing hypotheses from the findings of prior research. These articles generally use survey methods, although some are conceptual papers. According to Scapens and Bromwich (2001), theory is implicit in many studies, and they suggest the underlying theories should be inferred from the content of the papers. However, as expected, 19 articles in practitioner or professional journals are not grounded in any theoretical framework.



Theories	Frequency	Management accounting
Sociology <sup>a</sup>	18	innovations
Economics	13	minovations
Contingency theory	11	
Organizational behavior	9	
Production and operations management	2	515
Psychology	1 _	010
Strategic management	1	
Economics and organizational behavior	3	
Organizational behavior and sociology	2	
Economics and sociology	2	
Economics and POM	1	
Economics and contingency theory	1	
Organizational behavior and POM	1	
Organizational behavior and psychology	1	
Sociology and psychology	1	
Strategic management and contingency theory	1	
Others	2	
No explicit theory	19	
Total	89	

**Notes:** <sup>a</sup>Shields (1997) put in contingency theory under the category of sociology, it is believed that contingency theory is more aligned to organizational theories; considerable accounting research has used contingency theory to study the linkage between MCS and contextual factors (Chenhall, 2003). As a result, this theory is listed as a separate item

**Table V.** Distribution of theories

In MAIs research, sociology theories are derived from institutional theory, theory of translation, actor-network theory, innovation diffusion theory, stakeholder theory, structuration theory, trust theories, and enabling vs coercive formalization. Economic theories mainly involve principal-agent relationships with some articles based on classical utility theory, production cost economics, and Marxian economics.

Research grounded in organizational behavior is associated with motivational theories namely goal theory, expectancy theory, and X and Y theory. Research based on production and operation management theories incorporates quality and production process layout, whereas strategic management deals with strategy typologies and strategy process. Psychology theories include conflicts and social psychology.

Shields (1997) notes that half of the studies from North America were built on economics theory. The current review, however, indicates that research in MAIs is also heavily sourced from other disciplines, namely sociology, organizational behavior, and contingency theory. As the current review is on MAIs, sociology theories such as institutional theories and innovation diffusion theories prevail. These theories are mainly used in diffusion and adoption studies to identify the factors that influence the phenomenon. In addition, theories which stem from alternative management accounting positions (Baxter and Chua, 2003) have received a particular emphasis in the sampled articles.

With regard to management accounting change, the alternative approach emphasizes research in a micro-context and recognizes the influence of individuals. Old institutional economics and new institutional sociology are notable for analyzing the process, especially in field studies. Nevertheless, these theories are restricted to the



516

abstract process of stability and change (Burns and Scapens, 2000) and the notion of isomorphism (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983; Meyer and Rowan, 1977). They appear to overlook technical rationality and implementation outcome. As a result, Lounsbury (2008) highlighted institutional rationality as a new direction for research to move away from conventional neo-institutionalism. The institutional frameworks have further developed to embrace organizational diversity, for instance, the concept of institutional entrepreneurship that explores the roles of powerful actors that bring about change (Garud *et al.*, 2007).

# 3.4 Research approach

Table VI gives the distribution of research methods used in the sampled articles. The most frequent method used is survey (30 articles), followed by case study/field study and conceptual/practical insight (18 articles each), multiple research methods (eight), and archival methods (six). Other methods are experimentation (four), mathematical analytic (three), literature review (one), and action research (one).

It appears from our review that quantitative methods, which include surveys, experimentation, and mathematical analysis, are dominant in these articles. The survey method is employed in descriptive studies particularly to identify factors that influence the degree of adoption of management accounting practices and the reason they were used, apart from the extent of financial and non-financial information that was utilized. Explanatory-based studies using the survey method seek to find the optimal relationship between the implementation of various practices and outcome variables and contextual variables (Abernethy and Bouwens, 2005; Libby and Waterhouse, 1996; McGowan and Klammer, 1997; Shields, 1995). However, survey methods are often associated with controversies of bias, response rate, collection procedures, and inconsistency of findings with theories and previous research. As the survey method is imperative in management accounting research, researchers need to follow guidelines on appropriate survey procedures (Neuman, 2000; Sekaran, 2003). For example, to improve the response rate, Dillman (1983) suggested the use of total design method (TDM), which focuses on the design and the procedures of a survey. According to Dillman, among the principles of TDM in the design of an instrument are to avoid questions on the cover page and last page; the first question should apply to everyone; questions should be interesting and easy to answer; and the most-interesting and topic-related questions should be placed first, followed by potentially objectionable questions and finally, demographic information. For implementation procedures,

Research method	Frequency
Survey	30
Conceptual/practical insight	18
Case study/field study	18
Multiple research methods	8
Archival	6
Experimentation	4
Mathematical analytic	3
Literature review	1
Action research	1
Total	89

**Table VI.**Distribution of research methods



Dillman (1983) suggests appropriate content for the cover letter with printed mailing date, individual names and addresses, and signed by the researcher with a blue ballpoint using sufficient pressure. He suggests a postcard follow-up reminder be sent one week after the first mail-out, after three weeks a second cover letter and questionnaire to non-respondents, and after seven weeks another cover letter and replacement questionnaire.

Mathematical analysis primarily involving modeling was used in testing the principal agent relationship associated with compensation and determination of the effect of multiple cost drivers (Banker and Potter, 1993; Datar et al., 2001). In contrast to the other research methods, this method is relatively rare in this review. Archival method involves the collection of both quantitative and qualitative data. Quantitative data is related to firms' financial and non-financial information retrieved from the firms' databases and public databases. Qualitative data is obtained from publications and firms' documents. The reviewed articles based on quantitative archival research, mathematical analysis, and experimentation come almost entirely from North American journals and their authors are affiliated mainly with North American institutions. This might be due to the education system, especially in research programs. The doctorate program in the USA is more rigorous, consisting of coursework, comprehensive examinations, internship, and a thesis. For the first two years normally, the students need to complete coursework on accounting subjects, research methods, and various quantitative research tools such as statistics and econometrics before commencing their research. In the UK and Australia, usually there are little or no course components in many universities and the program tends to be shorter than in the USA.

On the other hand, qualitative/case study papers appear mostly in UK journals such as *AOS* and *MAR* (Selto and Widener, 2004). In this review, the percentage of case study/field study research is seen to be increasing in comparison to Shields' review of 1997. Case study/field study methods are paramount in understanding MAIs and change. As the response to change is unique to different organizations, these methods can explore many avenues depending on the research questions and theory chosen. In the sampled articles, case study/field study research is centered on the implementation of management accounting practices, ranging from the reasons for their design and adoption, to the multiple aspects of application and implementation processes (Agbejule, 2006; Emsley, 2008; Hussain and Hoque, 2002; Tuomela, 2005).

While a survey is likely to reveal an individual's perception of predetermined variables, a case study primarily involves a vast abstract area of social reality (Morgan and Smircich, 1980; Yin, 1994). The reliability of data could be improved through field studies whereby the information obtained from one source (e.g. interview) could be supported by information from other sources (e.g. documentation analysis and survey). To further enhance external validity and reduce observer bias, Yin (1994) suggested multiple cases be studied. Normally, the difficulty of this method is the aggregation of findings as they are fragmented to particular settings. Nevertheless, the case study/field study is often exploratory in nature and presents alternative perspectives (Yin, 1994) and the findings could suggest emergent variables to be tested empirically.

In innovation action research, researchers are actively involved in organizations to implement an idea, with their role as change agent in creating something new (Kaplan, 1998). As opposed to the case study/field study that investigates existing practices, the innovation action researcher is experiencing the development process, which may

518

add new insights to the literature. In this review, action research by Liu and Pan (2007) reported on the implementation of ABC from technical, behavioral, and organizational perspectives, from which they have identified new internal barriers to change.

Conceptual papers in this review are similar to the framework studies defined by Hesford *et al.* (2007). Such studies involve the development of new conceptual frameworks to provide new perspectives, and are drawn from multiple information sources and the authors' own synthesis (Hesford *et al.*, 2007). Practical insight, on the other hand, is not associated with theoretical testing; instead, it encompasses the description of management accounting practices that are usually based on practical experience. This type of research normally appears in applied research and practitioner literature and adopts an informal research style that does not rely on theory (Shields, 1997).

# 3.5 Results of prior research

This section briefly discusses the results of prior research studies on MAIs in general and articles on BSC, TQM, ABC and ABM, organizational/manufacturing, and employees' performance measures. The review of the findings will focus on these practices as they are relatively dominant in the sampled articles. Appendix summarizes the key issues addressed and the key findings of the 89 articles reviewed.

3.5.1 MAIs in general. There are a number of studies on MAIs that consider different management accounting practices as a whole. These articles analyze the development of management accounting practices, individual perceptions of innovation and change, accounting lag, the determinants and trends of adoption, the processes of change, and the unbundling of management accounting models.

Two articles by Kaplan provide the review on the development of management accounting before and after 1984. In the article published in 1984, Kaplan concluded that the traditional cost accounting models prior to 1984 are no longer adequate for new organizations with advanced manufacturing technology and competitive business environments. Subsequently, we witnessed the development of ABC and BSC which were reported in Kaplan's article published in 1994. Kaplan documented how ABC, operational control systems, and BSC were initially documented, elaborated, and disseminated through publications for the period of 1984-1994.

Similarly, Bjørnenak and Olson (1999) followed the development of management accounting literature to understand the changes in the characteristics of management accounting models. They unbundled the models into scope and systems dimensions, and found that contemporary management accounting models have experienced significant changes such as increased user-involvement and use of non-financial, external, disaggregated, and *ex ante* data.

Studies on the determinants of MAIs and change found various organizational, technical, and economic factors that influence the diffusion and adoption of these practices. The prevailing factors found in prior studies are global competition and changes in technology (Waweru *et al.*, 2004), performance gap (Lin and Yu, 2002), organizational structure (Abernethy and Bouwens, 2005; Cavalluzzo and Ittner, 2004), top management support (Cavalluzzo and Ittner, 2004), and the influence of government (Lapsley and Wright, 2004). Contradictorily, Libby and Waterhouse (1996) found that organizational structure, size, and competition did not predict changes in management accounting systems.

With regard to the use of management accounting systems, Libby and Waterhouse (1996) found a high rate of change in sampled organizations where the practices that support decision making and control were favored by the organizations. Their study however does not indicate specific management accounting practices being implemented in the organizations. Szendi and Elmore (1993) drew a distinction between contemporary and traditional management accounting practices. They found that new management accounting techniques are being adopted while traditional systems are being maintained, thus suggesting that management accounting is in a transitional stage. The inclination of organizations towards new management accounting techniques has been explained by Emsley *et al.* (2006). They suggest that management accountants whose behavior is innovative cognitive in style are more likely to initiate radical changes to the practices of their organizations.

3.5.2 Balanced scorecard. The articles on BSC found in this review generally focus on the design and use of BSC. A conceptual paper by Kaplan and Norton (2001) suggests the strategy map in BSC could manifest the critical elements and their linkages between the organization's strategies. However, as discussed by Johanson *et al.* (2006), an organization adopting a BSC approach might face dilemmas in implementation and employee mobilization, one-size-fits-all problems, the time dimension, and various organizational logistics.

Notwithstanding, both articles agree that the BSC is a holistic and balanced performance management approach, but might be subject to various interpretations and modifications to adapt to different settings. This is consistent with Funck's (2007) study which shows how the BSC is modified to meet the needs of different logistics in the public healthcare environment. He found that the concept of balance[8] is being translated as a balance between the four BSC perspectives; top-down control is mixed with a decentralized design and places less importance on the cause and effect relationship. In addition, Ax and Bjørnenak (2005) observe that the BSC has been integrated with other administrative innovations and made to appear attractive by what they describe as a "fashion-setting" process.

With regard to the use of the BSC, Malina and Selto (2001) found that managers respond positively to BSC measures by reorganizing resources and activities in order to improve performance in those areas. Tuomela (2005) found, in his case company, that the BSC was used for diagnostic and interactive control purposes and had specific implications for beliefs systems and boundary systems. Joseph (2008) observed that the BSC is used to implement stakeholder-based management strategy by addressing stakeholder issues while providing long-term growth and profitability. The BSC has also been used for capital investment decision making in a health care organization using a matrix approach (Lyons *et al.*, 2003).

Other studies on the BSC outside the domain of MAIs are by Davis and Albright (2004) and Hoque and James (2000). A quasi-experimental study by Davis and Albright (2004) found that the improvement in financial performance after the implementation of a BSC resulted in financial performance superior to non-BSC implementing organizations. Similarly, Hoque and James (2000) found from their survey that organizational performance increased with increased usage of BSC type measures. They also reported that BSC adoption is positively associated with the firm size and early product life cycle stage, but not with a firm's market position.



520

Overall, empirical studies on the BSC are limited, despite the BSC's widespread benefits (Ittner and Larcker, 1998b, Malmi, 2001). In particular, Davis and Albright (2004) regarded research on the benefits of the BSC as lacking though it is the primary research question in this area (Ittner and Larcker, 1998b).

3.5.3 TQM and management accounting. Similar to BSC, research on the relation between TQM and management accounting in this review is relatively limited. One stream of studies focuses on cost of quality and quality-related outcomes. For example, using a survey, Dunk (2002) wrote that quality performance is significantly associated with product quality and environmental accounting. Emsley (2008) studied two manufacturing plants of an organization and found the different ways the plants developed Juran's cost of quality techniques resulted in different outcomes. A descriptive study by Sjoblom (1998) indicates the wide use of non-financial quality indicators, because they are good proxies for financial impact, timelier, more reliable, and more relevant.

The other stream is related to the management accounting system in a TQM setting. First, Gurd *et al.* (2002) suggest the factors that reduce the accounting lag following the implementation of TQM are management commitment, strong leadership, education, and training programs. Second, Ittner and Larcker (1995) documented the association between TQM and non-traditional performance measures and reward systems.

Similarly, previous research reported that changes in management accounting are necessary for manufacturing practices. For example, Hoque and Alam (1999) observed that the management accounting system in their case organization changed to become more decentralized and project-oriented to fit in with TQM. However, research on the effect of the interaction between manufacturing practices and management accounting system on performance has produced mixed results. While, Abernethy and Lillis (1995) found that the association between these two practices affects performance, Ittner and Larcker (1995), Perera *et al.* (1997) and Sim and Killough (1998) found no positive association with performance. Abernethy and Lillis (1995) suggested that the different results are due to other factors that are not tested, such as the dynamic nature of organizations that experience different phases of change.

3.5.4 ABC and management. By and large, ABC/ABM research falls into four groups, namely descriptive studies to identify the extent of ABC/ABM adoption, the benefits of ABC/ABM and its effect on managers' and employees' satisfaction, factors influencing the adoption of ABC/ABM, and factors affecting the successful implementation of ABM.

Studies have shown that ABC/ABM generate the characteristics of information that are superior to traditional systems (McGowan, 1998), but would be less beneficial in the presence of information asymmetry (Mishra and Vaysman, 2001). The expected benefits, however, depend on the interaction of behavioral and cognitive conflict factors (Chenhall, 2004). The implementation of ABC/ABM is found to improve firm performance (Banker and Potter, 1993; Ittner *et al.*, 2002) and increased manager and employee satisfaction (Swenson, 1995; McGowan and Klammer, 1997).

Several studies attempted to investigate the determinants of the adoption of ABC/ABM. The dominant factors for the adoption of ABC/ABM reported are the institutional isomorphism (Agbejule, 2006; Malmi, 1999), technical efficiency of the system (Al-Omiri and Drury, 2007; Baird, 2007; Malmi, 1999), firm size (Baird, 2007; Brown *et al.*, 2004; Krumwiede, 1998), and top management support (Brown *et al.*, 2004).

With regard to the adoption of ABC/ABM, Baird (2007) and Bhimani *et al.* (2007) found the rates are varied in different countries. Bhimani *et al.* (2007) surveyed companies in seven countries namely Canada, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, the UK, and the USA. They found that half of the respondents in the USA and the UK were using ABC across units; while in France, more than half were using ABC in the majority of units. A high abandonment rate, however, was found amongst Japanese and Italian respondents. In Australia, Baird (2007) reported that the percentage of adoptions of activity management practices (Gosselin, 1997) in public sector organizations were higher than in the non-adopters. Comparing the survey results with Baird *et al.* (2004), the adoption rate of activity analysis is higher in public sector than private sector organizations. As he found that the adoption of activity cost analysis and ABC were lower in public sector organizations, Baird (2007) suggests that these organizations were using the practices more for improving processes for efficiency and effectiveness, than for determining the costs of goods and services.

In an earlier period, Shields (1995) found a moderate level of success of ABC implementation in US companies, of which most had realized a financial benefit from the system. Different levels of ABC success were also reported in other studies not included in this review. For example, Innes and Mitchell (1995) and Innes *et al.* (2000) found that success was considered high by respondents from UK companies, with the majority of them believing in the financial benefit received from ABC. However, a comparison of the two studies shows that the use and interest in ABC fell, with a higher rate in 1999 for companies that had not considered ABC or had rejected ABC. A review by Gosselin (2007) also concluded that the complexity of ABC has weakened the interest of many organizations to adopt it. He suggested that the level of actual adoption is indeed lower than the results from survey studies. Gosselin (2007) stated that this is due to the use of management accounting managers as survey respondents, which may not represent the perceptions of other managers, and because of the unclear definitions of ABC in the surveys, which leads to confusion of what is actually ABC.

3.5.5 Organizational/manufacturing performance measures. Research into organizational/manufacturing performance measures can be categorized into several prevalent issues. Studies have found that non-financial measures of customer satisfaction (Ittner and Larcker, 1998a) and the use of both financial and non-financial measures in compensation contracts (Said *et al.*, 2003) are the leading indicators for financial performance.

A conceptual paper by Cote and Latham (2004) emphasized the need to incorporate quality-related measures in performance measurement systems. Using a survey, Maiga and Jacobs (2005) proved that the importance of quality-related measures in MCS will influence quality performance and subsequently financial performance and customer satisfaction. In addition, clear definition and measurable goals are also crucial in affecting quantity and quality performance (Verbeteen, 2008).

A second type of research is on the attributes of performance measures within manufacturing contexts. According to Kaplan (1983), in order for manufacturing firms to remain competitive, the firms' management accounting systems should be able to support new manufacturing strategies. Specifically, firms need to strengthen measures on quality, inventory cost, productivity, new product technologies, discounted cash flows, and incentive schemes. Further, Banker *et al.* (1993) found that firms that



implement JIT, TQM, and teamwork practices may need to report manufacturing performance to their shop floor workers to improve their employees' morale.

Two other articles showed that non-financial performance measures are used in tandem with manufacturing strategies. A survey by Fullerton (2003) found that JIT firms use more non-financial performance measure and reward systems, as well as TQM measurement tools, than non-JIT firms. Particularly, the extensive use of subjective non-financial measures within firms using quality-based strategies may lead to higher performance (Van der Stede *et al.*, 2006).

A third research stream is related to the design and use of non-financial measures. In banking firms, the design and use of performance measures are influenced by institutional forces of coercive, mimetic, and normative aspects, together with economic constraints (Hussain and Hoque, 2002).

A fourth type of research suggests the use of non-financial measures to influence the behavior of managers and employees. For example, Webb (2004) reported that the use of strategic performance measurement systems has a positive impact on managerial commitment to improve performance. When comprehensive reporting systems and incentives tied to goals are involved, managers tend to spend more time working on non-financial measures than on financial areas (Ullrich and Tuttle, 2004). Another study suggests that to motivate the employees to improve goal-congruence effort, less distorted performance measures, and higher cash bonuses must be maintained (Bouwens and van Lent, 2006).

3.5.6 Employees' performance measures. Studies of incentive systems mostly attempted to determine the optimal incentive and mechanisms that result in positive outcomes. The use of non-financial measures (Banker et al., 2000) and financial controls (Kihn, 2007) were found to be associated with improved firm performance. Organizational trust can be improved through gain-sharing systems (Chenhall and Langfield-Smith, 2003) and employee creativity can be improved by placing emphasis on quantity measures in creativity-weighted pay schemes (Kachelmeier et al., 2008). To encourage innovation, Kennedy and Schleifer (2007) proposed a team performance measurement system that balances innovation and empowerment with control. In addition, the controllability of measures (Ghosh, 2005) and job-relevant information (JRI) and role ambiguity (RA) (Burney and Widener, 2007) were found to have a moderating effect on the relationship between performance measurement systems and performance. According to Ittner et al. (1997), the weight placed on the choice of non-financial measures over financial measures depends on the level of regulation, the implementation of innovation-oriented strategy, and strategic quality initiatives.

In conclusion, the summary of the findings on the five topics implies a likely pattern of research in the sampled articles. Although it represents only a fraction of the management accounting literature, one could illuminate the debate in those topics, and identify an area for future research. In the next section, we suggest some opportunities for future research.

### 4. Conclusions and future research

This paper presents a review of the literature on MAIs over the past ten years. Innovation in this paper is signified by advanced MACS practices and operations management techniques. In a nutshell, research on MAIs has focused on design and implementation aspects. Within the implementation-based research, descriptive studies

Management

accounting

innovations

This review includes prestigious accounting journals from North America, Europe, and Australia, wherein a diversity of research methods and theoretical frameworks used are apparent. There is increasing use of field studies using sociology theories in MAIs research. Sociology theories such as institutional theory and actor-network theory provide alternative perspectives to research by recognizing individual's power and highlighting the transition process of innovations.

Our review suggests a number of gaps in the existing literature. With regards to the evolution of these practices, it is plausible to conclude that the innovations seem stagnant, with research tending to extend the existing practices. Certain management accounting practices such as ABC/ABM and performance measurement systems have received considerable attention in the literature, involving various technical, behavioral, and sociological aspects. Therefore, a comprehensive review of these studies is needed to provide an overall understanding of what is known from the literature and to reach consensus on conflicting findings.

On the other hand, studies on target costing, benchmarking, value-based management, and life-cycle costing are still lacking. Whether management accounting practices are keeping pace with operations management techniques, research is needed to conform to different techniques. In relation to what is known about TQM and JIT setting, management accounting systems have improved with more emphasis given to non-financial information.

In the current review, most studies on MAIs were published after 2000, a period which has not been covered in prior reviews. This might indicate that research in this area has intensified during this period. However, from an analysis of prior studies, we find that research in this field is experiencing a slow pace of development whereby novel ideas are rather rare. A few new frameworks and techniques, for example, the measure network and time-driven ABC, mostly appear in practitioner journals.

In addition, previous reviews report on studies of management control topics in general and performance measurements in particular. The current review provides additional input by focusing on studies that incorporate research on MAIs such as BSC, ABC/ABM, and non-financial measures of performance, which have received increasing attention by researchers in recent years.

Further, recent research in management accounting is proliferating, as observed by Hesford *et al.* (2007). They found that the number of management accounting articles has increased especially after the introduction of new accounting journals. Therefore, the challenge to researchers is to find unexamined research questions which are worth researching. Ideas could come from existing literature and managers' perceptions (Foster and Young, 1997), or from observing changes in the environment. The other challenge is to determine whether research and theoretical assumptions reflect real practice. This ever-debated issue comes to the conclusion that research studies seem to emphasize aspects of the topic that are different to the needs of practitioners (Foster and Young, 1997; Johnson and Kaplan, 1987; Selto and Widener, 2004).

Innovation in management accounting systems is important particularly to organizations subject to globalization. Research in this area could assist organizations by suggesting optimal contexts, while enhancing the understanding of real practice



524

within the theoretical domain. The following subsections attempt to identify some areas for future research pertaining to MAIs.

## 4.1 Environmental uncertainty

In today's global market, managers need to be responsive to environmental change and maintain a proactive MCS. In a similar vein, researchers may formulate a dynamic model of environmental uncertainty to be incorporated in management control and operations management research. Environmental uncertainties encompass the organization's industrial, economic, technological, competitive, and customer environment (Gordon and Narayanan, 1984). However, now-a-days, recent global issues such as oil price fluctuation, soaring commodities prices, climate change, scarcity of natural resources, and political and economic uncertainties may exert pressure on business. Therefore, research could be conducted to explore how these contemporary factors affect an organization's strategies as well as MCS innovations and supply chain management.

### 4.2 Information technology

Similarly, advances in information and communication technology could significantly shape ways of doing business. The practice of management control may change as varying aspects of a firm become integrated via information technology (Dechow *et al.*, 2007). Research to further investigate the changing roles of MCS could be preceded by incorporating different information technology applications.

It can also be suggested that research on the interrelationship of different management accounting practices and information systems might be conducted. However, a clear boundary should be established between management accounting practices and accounting information systems. This is due to accounting software that seems to embrace the functions of management accounting practices related to cost management and management control (Granlund and Mouritsen, 2003; Lodh and Gaffikin, 2003). It is expected that these functions might gradually diminish the visibility of particular management accounting practices. Perhaps, future research is needed in this area to further investigate this issue.

#### 4.3 Control backage

Extensive research has been carried out to study the link between MCS and organizational characteristics, research which has been mainly based on contingency theory (Chenhall, 2003). Prior literature has identified the contextual factors that affect the use and usefulness of MCS such as environmental dimensions, technology, size, strategy, and organizational structure (Bruns and Waterhouse, 1975; Chapman, 2005; Chenhall and Morris, 1986; Dent, 1990; Granlund and Mouritsen, 2003; Hartmann and Moers, 1999). Studies have also examined the various tools of MCS, for example, budgeting, economic value added, costing systems, financial and non-financial performance measures, and the BSC (Abernethy and Stoelwinder, 1991; Biddle *et al.*, 1998; Davis and Albright, 2004; Gosselin, 1997; Henri, 2006a, b; Ittner *et al.*, 2003; Merchant, 1981; Otley, 1999).

However, considering separately certain components of MCS of an organization could lead to model underspecification (Chenhall, 2003; Dent, 1990; Langfield-Smith, 1997). The reliability of such findings could be questioned as the results might also be

Another area of possible research is the interface between TQM and BSC. Firms that have TQM in place need to implement a BSC to identify appropriate multidimensional, non-financial, and financial information, to signal the managers the focus for their day-to-day work, as well as to motivate and reward employees (Hoque, 2003). However, the emphasis placed on employee satisfaction in TQM (Hoque, 2003) while BSC is generally hierarchically orientated (Modell, 2009) could be examined to determine whether the two systems are complementary or in conflict with each other. Subscribing to Hoque's (2003) suggestion, the optimal progression for an organization adopting BSC followed by TQM, or vice versa could be investigated, as well as how they fit with contingent factors.

Other integration which could be analyzed is between formal and informal control systems. While formal control has been widely researched, research on informal control practices is still lacking. Informal controls could be organizational culture (Langfield-Smith, 1997) and organizational structure (Otley, 2003). Other factors that might act as informal controls, including trust of the organization and between the organization's members and job security, could be investigated. In addition, examination of the interaction between the formal control system and other areas, such as corporate governance, human resource management, internal control, and financial management, is also worthwhile.

However, because there are many unlimited elements inside and outside organizations that can impose control, Malmi and Brown (2008) call for researchers to define the domain of control that they wish to study. A MCS, according to Malmi and Brown (2008), pertains to all the devices and systems used by managers to direct employees' behavior consistent with organization's objectives and strategies. In this case, they suggest that researchers need to be analytical in deciding the MCS, because a system used to support decision making that does not monitor employees' goal congruence and behavior is not a MCS, but an accounting system. Further, they propose the conditions to regard MCS as a package when the systems are recognized discretely and generally established by different interest groups at different times.

A special issue to address the MCS as a package was published in *MAR*, Volume 19, Issue 4 in 2008. In essence, one of the issues discussed in these articles is the factors that shape MCS packages. Specifically, in different types of organizations, accounting practices and organizational structures (Kennedy and Widener, 2008), functional demands (Sandelin, 2008), perceptions of trust (Langfield-Smith, 2008b) as well as social, technical, institutional, and economic structures (Van der Meer-Kooistra and Scapens, 2009) influence the design and use of various MCS packages. Malmi and Brown (2008), however, observed that different conceptualizations of MSC used in the papers may result in difficulties in establishing consistent findings. Therefore, in the editorial, Malmi and Brown (2008) construct a typology of MSC packages to classify the different types of control that could be incorporated in future studies.

### 4.4 Management accounting change and innovation

In explaining management accounting change, research could also draw on theories of innovation diffusion. The innovation diffusion approach provides a different view of management accounting studies, taking the perspective of the potential adopter to show



that firms will not always attempt to imitate resources that produce a competitive advantage (Powell, 1995). Aspects being studied using this approach are efficiency, the characteristics of innovation, and the role of propagators (Ax and Bjørnenak, 2007). However, in the management accounting field, this approach is relatively lacking, with only a brief discussion on the process of adoption and diffusion (Firth, 1996). Alternatively, future research could be also founded on Birkinshaw *et al.* (2008) framework that spans the invention to the implementation of novel management activities, termed management innovation. This area was studied from an institutional perspective, fashion perspective, cultural perspective, and rational perspective, which are dominant in the literature (Birkinshaw *et al.*, 2008).

The researcher could also consider a study using triangulation of theories to capture different dimensions of a phenomenon. Complementing different theories could provide more comprehensive understanding of the study (Hopper and Hoque, 2006; Lounsbury, 2008). For example, the principles of innovation diffusion theory that emphasize the effectiveness of innovation could be complemented by institutional theory that presumes social legitimization. Similarly, different views could also be applied to understand management innovation, for instance by focusing on the contextual dynamics of institutional, fashion and rational perspectives in the different phases of the management innovation process. As well, researchers could examine the recent management tools utilized in practice such as financial application for problem solving. Neural networks systems as well as time series analysis are starting to be used for forecasting, budgeting, and cost determination (Brown *et al.*, 1995; Vellido *et al.*, 1999).

In conclusion, this paper adds to our understanding of MAIs by describing the attributes of management accounting practices and operations management research. However, because our review involves a small sample size, caution must be exercised, as the findings might not be generalized to the management accounting literature as a whole, due to several limitations. First, regarding the types of publications included in the review, this paper focuses only on 22 international accounting journals as mentioned earlier in the paper; the issue of MAIs has been discussed in other international and local accounting journals as well as in handbooks, edited books, and professional and academic magazines. This paper also does not include publications from other management subject areas such as operations and logistic management, human resource management, and public sector management where many accounting scholars have contributed papers. There are many articles on MAIs published in the journals searched that are not included in the review. Second, a keywords search was used in selecting the articles for this review, which means that certain other articles that also discussed MAIs may not be listed in the search results (two examples are Ashton (2007) and Malmi and Ikäheimo (2003)). Nevertheless, this paper has provided a number of questions to be considered in further investigations.

#### Notes

- 1. The review papers on management accounting, *inter alia* Elnathan *et al.* (1996), Hesford *et al.* (2007), Ittner and Larcker (1998b, 2001), Langfield-Smith (2008a), Otley *et al.* (1995), Scapens and Bromwich (2001), Selto and Widener (2004), Shields (1997), and Young and Selto (1991).
- 2. They are: TAR, AOS, CAR, JAE, JAR, and JMAR.



- 3. For example, Ahire *et al.* (1995) on TQM, Ansari *et al.* (2007) on target costing, Elnathan *et al.* (1996) on benchmarking, Gosselin (2007) on ABC, Ittner and Larcker (2001) on value-based management and Langfield-Smith (2008a) on strategic management accounting.
- 4. The search was conducted on the online databases that host the above-mentioned journals, which are ABI/INFORM Global (Proquest), APAFT (Informit), Emerald Fulltext, Expanded Academic ASAP Informaworld, JSTOR, Science Direct (Elsevier), and Wiley Interscience Journals.
- 5. Although we covered the same period as previous reviews, focus was mainly on studies in 2000-2008 period.
- 6. We used "Google Scholar" for identifying most widely cited articles.
- A generic setting involves a general, abstract, or simplified setting for analytic modeling or experimental hypothesis testing (Scapens and Bromwich, 2001; Shields, 1997).
- 8. Funck (2007) argued that the concept of balance between measures in Kaplan and Norton's (1996a, b) publications and the hierarchy between the four perspectives was perceived as contradictory.

#### References

- Abernethy, M.A. and Bouwens, J. (2005), "Determinants of accounting innovation implementation", *Abacus*, Vol. 41 No. 3, pp. 217-40.
- Abernethy, M.A. and Lillis, A. (1995), "The impact of manufacturing flexibility on management control system design", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 20 No. 4, pp. 241-58.
- Abernethy, M.A. and Stoelwinder, J.U. (1991), "Budget use, task uncertainty, system goal orientation and subunit performance: a test of the 'fit' hypothesis in not-for-profit hospitals", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 16 No. 2, pp. 105-20.
- Agbejule, A. (2006), "Motivation for activity-based costing implementation: administrative and institutional influences", *Journal of Accounting & Organisational Change*, Vol. 2 No. 1, pp. 42-73.
- Ahire, J., Landeros, R. and Golhar, D.Y. (1995), "Total quality management: a literature review and an agenda for future research", *Production and Operations Management*, Vol. 4 No. 3, pp. 277-306.
- Ahrens, T. and Dent, J.F. (1998), "Accounting and organizations: realizing the richness of field research", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 10, pp. 1-39.
- Alcouffe, S., Berland, N. and Levant, Y. (2008), "Actor-networks and the diffusion of management accounting innovations: a comparative study", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 19, pp. 1-17.
- Al-Omiri, M. and Drury, C. (2007), "Organizational and behavioral factors influencing the adoption and success of ABC in the UK", *Journal of Cost Management*, Vol. 21 No. 6, pp. 38-48.
- Ansari, S., Bell, J. and Okano, H. (2007), "Target costing: uncharted research territory", in Chapman, C.S., Hopwood, A.G. and Shields, M.D. (Eds), *Handbook of Management Accounting Research*, Elsevier, Oxford, pp. 507-30.
- Argyris, C. and Kaplan, R.S. (1994), "Implementing new knowledge: the case of activity-based costing", *Accounting Horizons*, Vol. 8 No. 3, pp. 83-105.
- Ashton, R.H. (2007), "Value-creation models for value-based management: review, analysis, and research directions", *Advances in Management Accounting*, Vol. 16, pp. 1-62.
- Ax, C. and Bjørnenak, T. (2005), "Bundling and diffusion of management accounting innovations the case of the balanced scorecard in Sweden", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 16, pp. 1-20.



- Ax, C. and Bjørnenak, T. (2007), "Management accounting innovations: origins and diffusion", in Hopper, T., Northcott, D. and Scapens, R. (Eds), *Issues in Management Accounting*, 3rd ed., Pearson Education, Harlow, pp. 357-76.
- Baird, K. (2007), "Adoption of activity management practices in public sector organizations", Accounting and Finance, Vol. 47, pp. 551-69.
- Baird, K.M., Harrison, G.L. and Reeve, R.C. (2004), "Adoption of activity management practices: a note on the extent of adoption and the influence of organizational and cultural factors", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 15, pp. 383-99.
- Banker, R.D. and Potter, G. (1993), "Economic implications of single cost driver systems", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 15-32.
- Banker, R.D., Potter, G. and Schroeder, R.G. (1993), "Reporting manufacturing performance measures to workers: an empirical study", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 33-55.
- Banker, R.D., Potter, G. and Srinivasan, D. (2000), "Incentive plan that includes nonfinancial performance measures", *The Accounting Review*, Vol. 75 No. 1, pp. 65-92.
- Baxter, J.A. and Chua, W.F. (1998), "Doing field research: practice and meta-theory in counterpoint", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 33-55.
- Baxter, J.A. and Chua, W.F. (2003), "Alternative management accounting research whence and whither", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 28, pp. 97-126.
- Becker, S.W. and Whisler, T.L. (1967), "The innovative organization: a selective view of current theory and research", *The Journal of Business*, Vol. 40 No. 4, pp. 462-9.
- Bhimani, A., Gosselin, M., Ncube, M. and Okano, H. (2007), "Activity-based costing: how far have we come internationally?", *Cost Management*, Vol. 21 No. 3, pp. 12-17.
- Biddle, G.C., Bowen, R.M. and Wallace, J.S. (1998), "Does EVA beat earnings? Evidence on the association with stock returns and financial values", *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 24, pp. 301-36.
- Birkinshaw, J., Hamel, G. and Mol, M.J. (2008), "Management innovation", *Academy of Management Review*, Vol. 33 No. 4, pp. 825-45.
- Bisbe, J., Batista-Foguet, J. and Chenhall, R. (2007), "Defining management accounting constructs: a methodological note on the risks of conceptual misspecification", *Accounting Organizations and Society*, Vol. 32 Nos 7-9, pp. 789-820.
- Bjørnenak, T. and Olson, O. (1999), "Unbundling management accounting innovations", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 10, pp. 325-38.
- Bourguignon, A. (2005), "Management accounting and value creation: the profit and loss of reification", *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, Vol. 16 No. 4, pp. 353-89.
- Bouwens, J. and van Lent, L. (2006), "Performance measure properties and the effect of incentive contracts", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 18, pp. 55-75.
- Briers, M. and Chua, W.F. (2001), "The role of actor-networks and boundary objects in management accounting change: a field study of an implementation of activity-based costing", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 26, pp. 237-69.
- Brown, C., Coakley, E.J. and Phillips, M.E. (1995), "Neural networks enter the world of management accounting", *Management Accounting*, Vol. 76, pp. 51-5.
- Brown, D.A., Booth, P. and Giacobbe, F. (2004), "Technological and organizational influences on the adoption of activity-based costing in Australia", *Accounting and Finance*, Vol. 44 No. 3, pp. 329-56.

- Burney, L. and Widener, S.K. (2007), "Strategic performance measurement systems, job-relevant information, and managerial behavioral responses role stress and performance", *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, Vol. 19, pp. 43-69.
- Burns, J. and Scapens, R. (2000), "Conceptualising management accounting change: an institutional framework", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 11, pp. 3-25.
- Cadez, S. and Guilding, C. (2008), "An exploratory investigation of an integrated contingency model of strategic management accounting", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 33 Nos 7/8, pp. 836-63.
- Cavalluzzo, K.S. and Ittner, C.D. (2004), "Implementing performance measurement innovations: evidence from government", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 29, pp. 243-67.
- Chapman, C. (2005), "Not because they are new: developing the contribution of enterprise resource planning systems to management control research", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 30 Nos 7/8, pp. 685-9.
- Chenhall, R.H. (2003), "Management control systems design within its organizational context: findings from contingency-based research and directions for the future", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 28, pp. 127-68.
- Chenhall, R.H. (2004), "The role of cognitive and affective conflict in early implementation of activity-based cost management", *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, Vol. 16, pp. 19-44.
- Chenhall, R.H. (2005), "Integrative strategic performance measurement systems, strategic alignment of manufacturing, learning and strategic outcomes: an exploratory study", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 30, pp. 395-422.
- Chenhall, R.H. and Langfield-Smith, K. (1998), "The relationship between strategic priorities, management techniques and management accounting: an empirical investigation using a systems approach", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 23 No. 3, pp. 243-64.
- Chenhall, R.H. and Langfield-Smith, K. (2003), "Performance measurement and reward systems, trust, and strategic change", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 15, pp. 117-43.
- Chenhall, R.H. and Morris, D. (1986), "The impact of structure, environment and interdependence on the perceived usefulness of management accounting systems", *The Accounting Review*, Vol. 61 No. 1, pp. 16-35.
- Cote, J. and Latham, C. (2004), "Relationship quality: a critical link in management accounting performance measurement systems", Advances in Management Accounting, Vol. 12, pp. 171-90.
- Datar, S., Kulp, S.C. and Lambert, R.A. (2001), "Balancing performance measures", *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 39 No. 1, pp. 75-92.
- Davis, S. and Albright, T. (2004), "An investigation of the effect of balanced scorecard implementation on financial performance", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 15, pp. 135-53.
- Dechow, N., Grandlund, M. and Mouritsen, J. (2007), "Managing accounting change", in Hopper, T., Northcott, D. and Scapens, R. (Eds), *Issues in Management Accounting*, Pearson Education, Harlow, pp. 45-64.
- Dent, J.F. (1990), "Strategy, organization and control: some possibilities for accounting research", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 15 Nos 1/2, pp. 3-25.



- Dillman, D.A. (1983), "Mail and other self-administered questionnaires", in Rossi, P.H., Wright, J.D. and Anderson, A.B. (Eds), *Handbook of Survey Research*, Academic Press, Orlando, FL.
- DiMaggio, P.J. and Powell, W.W. (1983), "The iron cage revisited: institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields", American Sociological Review, Vol. 48, pp. 147-60.
- Dunk, A.S. (1989), "Management accounting lag", Abacus, Vol. 25 No. 2, pp. 149-55.
- Dunk, A.S. (2002), "Product quality, environmental accounting an quality performance", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 15 No. 5, pp. 719-32.
- Elnathan, D., Lin, T. and Young, S.M. (1996), "Benchmarking and management accounting: a framework for research", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 8, pp. 37-54.
- Emsley, D. (2008), "Different interpretations of a 'fixed' concept: examining Juran's cost of quality from an actor-network perspective", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 21 No. 3, pp. 375-97.
- Emsley, D., Nevicky, B. and Harrison, G. (2006), "Effect of cognitive style and professional development on the initiation of radical and non-radical management accounting innovations", *Accounting and Finance*, Vol. 46, pp. 243-64.
- Evan, W.M. and Black, G. (1967), "Innovation in business organizations: some factors associated with success or failure of staff proposals", *The Journal of Business*, Vol. 40 No. 4, pp. 519-30.
- Ezzamel, M. and Willmott, H. (1998), "Accounting, remuneration and employee motivation in the new organization", *Accounting & Business Research*, Vol. 28 No. 2, pp. 97-110.
- Ezzamel, M., Willmott, H. and Worthington, F. (2008), "Manufacturing shareholder value: the role of accounting in organizational transformation", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 33 Nos 2/3, pp. 107-40.
- Firth, M. (1996), "The diffusion of managerial accounting procedures in the People's Republic of China and the influence of foreign partnered joint ventures", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 21 Nos 7/8, pp. 629-54.
- Foster, B.P. and Ward, J.W. (1994), "Theory of perpetual management accounting innovation lag in hierarchical organizations", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 19, pp. 401-11.
- Foster, G. and Young, S.M. (1997), "Frontiers of management accounting research", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 9, pp. 63-77.
- Free, C. (2008), "Walking the talk? Supply chain accounting and trust among UK supermarkets and suppliers", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 33 No. 6, pp. 629-62.
- Fullerton, R.R. (2003), "Performance measurement and reward systems in JIT and non-JIT firms", Journal of Cost Management, Vol. 17 No. 6, pp. 40-8.
- Funck, E. (2007), "The balanced scorecard equates interests in healthcare organizations", *Journal of Accounting & Organisational Change*, Vol. 3 No. 2, pp. 88-103.
- Garud, R., Hardy, C. and Maguire, S. (2007), "Institutional entrepreneurship as embedded agency: an introduction to the special issue", *Organization Studies*, Vol. 28 No. 7, pp. 957-69.
- Ghosh, D. (2005), "Alternative measures of managers' performance, controllability, and the outcome effect", *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, Vol. 17, pp. 55-70.
- Gordon, L.A. and Narayanan, V.K. (1984), "Management accounting systems, perceived environmental uncertainty and organization structure: an empirical investigation", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 9 No. 1, pp. 33-47.

- Gosselin, M. (1997), "The effects of strategy and organizational structure on the adoption and implementation of activity-based costing", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 22 No. 2, pp. 105-22.
- Gosselin, M. (2007), "A review of activity-based costing: technique, implementation, and consequences", in Chapman, C.S., Hopwood, A.G. and Shields, M.D. (Eds), *Handbook of Management Accounting Research*, Elsevier, Oxford, pp. 641-71.
- Granlund, M. and Lukka, K. (1998), "It's a small world of management accounting practices", Journal of Management Accounting Research, Vol. 10, pp. 153-79.
- Granlund, M. and Mouritsen, J. (2003), "Problematizing the relationship between management control and information technology", *European Accounting Review*, Vol. 12, pp. 77-83.
- Grasso, L.P. (2006), "Barriers to lean accounting", Cost Management, Vol. 20 No. 2, pp. 6-19.
- Gurd, B., Smith, M. and Swaffer, A. (2002), "Factors impacting on accounting lag: an exploratory study of responding to TQM", *British Accounting Review*, Vol. 34, pp. 205-21.
- Hartmann, F. and Moers, F. (1999), "Testing contingency hypotheses in budgetary research: an evaluation of the moderated regression analysis", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 24 No. 4, pp. 291-315.
- Henri, J.-F. (2006a), "Management control systems and strategy: a resource-based perspective", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 31, pp. 529-58.
- Henri, J.-F. (2006b), "Organizational culture and performance measurement systems", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 31, pp. 77-103.
- Hesford, J.W., Lee, S.-H., van der Stede, W.A. and Young, S.M. (2007), "Management accounting: a bibliographic study", in Chapman, C.S., Hopwood, A.G. and Shields, M.D. (Eds), *Handbook of Management Accounting Research*, Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp. 3-26.
- Hicks, J.J.O. (1978), "An examination of accounting interest groups' differential perceptions of innovations", The Accounting Review, Vol. 53 No. 2, pp. 371-88.
- Hopper, T. and Hoque, Z. (2006), "Triangulation approaches to accounting research", in Hoque, Z. (Ed.), *Methodological Issues in Accounting Research: Theories and Methods*, Spiramus Press, London.
- Hoque, Z. (2003), "Total quality management and the balances scorecard approach: a critical analysis of their potential relationships and directions for future research", Critical Perspectives on Accounting, Vol. 14, pp. 553-66.
- Hoque, Z. and Alam, M. (1999), "TQM adoption, institutionalism and changes in management accounting systems: a case study", *Accounting and Business Research*, Vol. 29 No. 3, pp. 199-210.
- Hoque, Z. and James, W. (2000), "Linking balanced scorecard measures to size and market factors: impact on organizational performance", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 12, pp. 1-17.
- Huntzinger, J. (2006), "Economies of scale are dead: right-sizing for effective cost management and operation", Cost Management, Vol. 20 No. 1, pp. 18-26.
- Hussain, M.M. and Hoque, Z. (2002), "Understanding non-financial performance measurement practices in Japanese banks: a new institutional sociology perspective", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 15 No. 2, pp. 162-83.
- Innes, J. and Mitchell, F. (1995), "A survey of activity-based costing in the UK's largest companies", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 6, pp. 137-53.
- Innes, J., Mitchell, F. and Sinclair, D. (2000), "Activity-based costing in the UK's largest companies: a comparison of 1994 and 1999 survey results", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 11, pp. 349-62.



- Ittner, C.D. and Larcker, D.F. (1995), "Total quality management and the choice of information and reward systems", *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 33, pp. 1-34 (supplement).
- Ittner, C.D. and Larcker, D.F. (1998a), "Are nonfinancial measures leading indicator of financial performance? An analysis of customer satisfaction", *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 36, pp. 1-35 (supplement).
- Ittner, C.D. and Larcker, D.F. (1998b), "Innovations in performance measurement: trends and research implications", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 10, pp. 205-38.
- Ittner, C.D. and Larcker, D.F. (2001), "Assessing empirical research in managerial accounting: a value-based management perspective", *Journal of Accounting and Economis*, Vol. 32, pp. 349-410.
- Ittner, C.D., Lanen, W.N. and Larcker, D.F. (2002), "The association between activity-based costing and manufacturing performance", *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 40 No. 3, pp. 711-26.
- Ittner, C.D., Larcker, D.F. and Meyer, M.W. (2003), "Subjectivity and the weighting of performance measures: evidence from a balanced scorecard", *The Accounting Review*, Vol. 78 No. 3, pp. 725-58.
- Ittner, C.D., Larcker, D.F. and Rajan, M.V. (1997), "The choice of performance measures in annual bonus contracts", *The Accounting Review*, Vol. 72 No. 2, pp. 231-55.
- Johanson, U., Skoog, M., Backlund, A. and Almqvist, R. (2006), "Balancing dilemmas of the balanced scorecard", Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, Vol. 19 No. 6, pp. 842-57.
- Johnson, H.T. and Kaplan, R.S. (1987), Relevance Lost: The Rise and Fall of Management Accounting, Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA.
- Jones, G.M. (1962), "Accounting innovation and the psychology of change", The Accounting Review, Vol. 37 No. 2, pp. 244-50.
- Joseph, G. (2008), "A rationale for stakeholder-based management in developing nations", *Journal of Accounting & Organisational Change*, Vol. 4 No. 2, pp. 136-61.
- Kachelmeier, S.J., Reichert, B.E. and Williamson, M.G. (2008), "Measuring and motivating quantity, creativity, or both", *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 46 No. 2, pp. 341-73.
- Kaplan, R.S. (1983), "Measuring manufacturing performance: a new challenge for managerial accounting research", *The Accounting Review*, Vol. 58 No. 4, pp. 686-705.
- Kaplan, R.S. (1984), "The evolution of management accounting", The Accounting Review, Vol. 59 No. 3, pp. 390-418.
- Kaplan, R.S. (1994), "Management accounting (1984-1994): development of new practice and theory", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 247-60.
- Kaplan, R.S. (1998), "Innovation action research: creating new management theory and practice", Journal of Management Accounting Research, Vol. 10, pp. 89-118.
- Kaplan, R.S. and Anderson, S.R. (2007), "The innovation of time-driven activity-based costing", Cost Management, Vol. 21 No. 2, pp. 5-15.
- Kaplan, R.S. and Norton, D.P. (1992), "The balanced scorecard measures that drive performance", *Harvard Business Review*, Vol. 70, pp. 71-9.
- Kaplan, R.S. and Norton, D.P. (1996a), *The Balanced Scorecard: Translating Strategy into Action*, Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA.
- Kaplan, R.S. and Norton, D.P. (1996b), "Using the balanced scorecard as a strategic management system", *Harvard Business Review*, Vol. 74 No. 1, pp. 75-85.

- Kaplan, R.S. and Norton, D.P. (2001), "Transforming the balanced scorecard from performance measurement to strategic management: Part I", Accounting Horizons, Vol. 15 No. 1, pp. 87-104.
- Kennedy, F. and Schleifer, L. (2007), "Team performance measurement: a system to balance innovation and empowerment with control", Advances in Management Accounting, Vol. 16, pp. 261-85.
- Kennedy, F.A. and Widener, S.K. (2008), "A control framework: insights from evidence on lean accounting", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 19 No. 4, pp. 301-23.
- Kihn, L.-A. (2007), "Financial consequences in foreign subsidiary manager performance evaluations", *European Accounting Review*, Vol. 16 No. 3, pp. 531-54.
- Krumwiede, K.R. (1998), "The implementation stages of activity-based costing and the impact of contextual and organizational factors", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 10, pp. 239-77.
- Langfield-Smith, K. (1997), "Management control systems and strategy: a critical review", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 22 No. 2, pp. 207-32.
- Langfield-Smith, K. (2008a), "Strategic management accounting: how far have we come in 25 years?", Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, Vol. 21 No. 2, pp. 204-28.
- Langfield-Smith, K. (2008b), "The relations between transactional characteristics, trust and risk in the start-up phase of a collaborative alliance", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 19 No. 4, pp. 344-64.
- Lapsley, I. and Wright, E. (2004), "The diffusion of management accounting innovations in the public sector: a research agenda", Management Accounting Research, Vol. 15, pp. 355-74.
- Lebas, M. (1994), "Managerial accounting in France: overview of past tradition and current practice", *The European Accounting Review*, Vol. 3, pp. 471-87.
- Libby, T. and Waterhouse, J. (1996), "Predicting change in management accounting systems", Journal of Management Accounting Research, Vol. 8, pp. 137-50.
- Liedtka, S.L. (2005), "Analytic hierarchy process and multi-criteria performance management systems", Cost Management, Vol. 19 No. 6, pp. 30-8.
- Lin, Z.J. and Yu, Z. (2002), "Responsibility cost control system in China: a case of management accounting application", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 13 No. 4, pp. 447-67.
- Liu, L.Y.J. and Pan, F. (2007), "The implementation of activity-based costing in China: an innovation action research approach", The British Accounting Review, Vol. 39, pp. 249-64.
- Lodh, S. and Gaffikin, M. (2003), "Implementation of an integrated accounting and cost management system using the SAP system: a field study", European Accounting Review, Vol. 12 No. 1, pp. 85-121.
- Lounsbury, M. (2008), "Institutional rationality and practice variation: new directions in the institutional analysis of practice", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 33, pp. 349-61.
- Lyons, B., Gumbus, A. and Bellhouse, D.E. (2003), "Aligning capital investment decisions with the balanced scorecard", *Journal of Cost Management*, Vol. 17 No. 2, pp. 34-8.
- McGowan, A.S. (1998), "Perceived benefits of ABCM implementation", *Accounting Horizons*, Vol. 12 No. 1, pp. 31-50.
- McGowan, A.S. and Klammer, T.P. (1997), "Satisfaction with activity-based cost management implementation", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 9, pp. 217-37.



- Maiga, A.S. and Jacobs, F.A. (2005), "Antecedents and consequences of quality performance", Behavioral Research in Accounting, Vol. 17, pp. 111-31.
- Malina, M.A. and Selto, F.H. (2001), "Communicating and controlling strategy: an empirical study of the effectiveness of the balanced scorecard", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 13, pp. 47-90.
- Malmi, T. (1999), "Activity-based costing diffusion across organizations: an exploratory empirical analysis of Finnish firms", Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 24, pp. 649-72.
- Malmi, T. (2001), "Balanced scorecards in Finnish companies: a research note", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 12, pp. 207-20.
- Malmi, T. and Brown, D.A. (2008), "Management control systems as a package opportunities, challenges and research directions", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 19, pp. 287-300.
- Malmi, T. and Ikäheimo, S. (2003), "Value based management practices some evidence from the field", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 14 No. 3, pp. 235-54.
- Merchant, K.A. (1981), "The design of corporate budgeting system: influences on managerial behavior and performance", *The Accounting Review*, Vol. 56 No. 4, pp. 813-29.
- Merchant, K.A. (2006), "Measuring general managers' performances: market, accounting and combination-of-measures systems", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 19 No. 6, pp. 893-917.
- Meyer, J.W. and Rowan, B. (1977), "Institutionalized organizations: formal structure as myth and ceremony", *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 83 No. 2, pp. 340-63.
- Mishra, B. and Vaysman, I. (2001), "Cost-system choice and incentives traditional vs activity-based costing", *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 39 No. 3, pp. 619-41.
- Modell, S. (2009), "Bundling management control innovations: a field study of organisational experimenting with total quality management and the balanced scorecard", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 22 No. 1, pp. 59-90.
- Mohr, L.B. (1969), "Determinants of innovation in organizations", *The American Political Science Review*, Vol. 63 No. 1, pp. 111-26.
- Morgan, G. and Smircich, L. (1980), "The case for qualitative research", *Academy of Management Review*, Vol. 5, pp. 491-500.
- Naranjo-Gil, D. and Hartmann, F. (2006), "How top management teams use management accounting systems to implement strategy", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 18 No. 1, pp. 21-53.
- Neuman, W.L. (2000), Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches, Allyn and Bacon, Boston, MA.
- Otley, D. (1999), "Performance management: a framework for management control systems research", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 10, pp. 363-82.
- Otley, D. (2003), "Management control and performance management: whence and whither", *The British Accounting Review*, Vol. 35, pp. 309-26.
- Otley, D., Broadbent, J. and Berry, A. (1995), "Research in management control: an overview of its development", *British Journal of Management*, Vol. 6, pp. 531-44 (special issue).
- Perera, S., Harrison, G. and Poole, M. (1997), "Customer-focused manufacturing strategy and the use of operations-based non-financial performance measures: a research note", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 22 No. 6, pp. 557-72.

- Powell, T.C. (1995), "Total quality management as competitive advantage: a review and empirical study", *Strategic Management Journal*, Vol. 16 No. 1, pp. 15-37.
- Reid, G.C. and Smith, J.A. (2000), "The impact of contingencies on management accounting system development", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 11 No. 4, pp. 427-50.
- Reilly, G.P. and Reilly, R.R. (2000), "Using a measure network to understand and deliver value", *Cost Management*, Vol. 14 No. 6, pp. 5-14.
- Said, A.A., HassabElnaby, H.R. and Wier, B. (2003), "An empirical investigation of the performance consequences of nonfinancial measures", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 15, pp. 193-223.
- Sandelin, M. (2008), "Operation of management control practices as a package a case study on control system variety in a growth firm context", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 19 No. 4, pp. 324-43.
- Scapens, R. and Bromwich, M. (2001), "Editorial report management accounting research: the first decade", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 12, pp. 245-54.
- Sekaran, U. (2003), Research Methods for Business: A Skill Building Approach, Wiley, New York, NY.
- Selto, F.H. and Widener, S.K. (2004), "New directions in management accounting research: insights from practice", *Advances in Management Accounting*, Vol. 12, pp. 1-35.
- Shields, M.D. (1995), "An empirical analysis of firms' implementation experiences with activity-based costing", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 7, p. 148.
- Shields, M.D. (1997), "Research in management accounting by North Americans in the 1990s", Journal of Management Accounting Research, Vol. 9, pp. 3-61.
- Sim, K.L. and Killough, L.N. (1998), "The performance effects of complementarities between manufacturing practices and management accounting systems", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 10, pp. 325-46.
- Sisaye, S. (2003), "Process innovation and adaptive institutional change strategies in management control systems: activity based costing as administrative innovation", *Advances in Management Accounting*, Vol. 11, pp. 251-85.
- Sjoblom, L.M. (1998), "Financial information and quality management is there a role for accountants?", *Accounting Horizons*, Vol. 12 No. 4, pp. 363-73.
- Swenson, D. (1995), "The benefits of activity-based cost management to the manufacturing industry", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 7, pp. 167-80.
- Szendi, J.Z. and Elmore, R.C. (1993), "Management accounting: are new techniques making in-roads with practitioners?", *Journal of Accounting Education*, Vol. 11, pp. 61-76.
- Thor, C.G. (2000), "The evolution of performance measurement in government", Cost Management, Vol. 14 No. 3, pp. 18-26.
- Tuomela, T.-S. (2005), "The interplay of different levers of control: a case study of introducing a new performance measurement system", *Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 16, pp. 293-320.
- Ullrich, M.J. and Tuttle, B.M. (2004), "The effects of comprehensive information reporting systems and economic incentives on managers' time-planning decisions", *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, Vol. 16, pp. 89-105.
- Van der Meer-Kooistra, J. and Scapens, R.W. (2009), "The governance of lateral relations between and within organisations", *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, Vol. 19 No. 4, pp. 365-84.



- Van der Stede, W.A., Chow, C.W. and Lin, T.W. (2006), "Strategy, choice of performance measures, and performance", *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, Vol. 18, pp. 185-205.
- Vellido, A., Lisboa, P.J.G. and Vaughan, J. (1999), "Neural networks in business: a survey of applications (1992-1998)", Expert Systems with Applications, Vol. 17, pp. 51-70.
- Verbeteen, F.H.M. (2008), "Performance management practices in public sector organizations: impact on performance", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 21 No. 3, pp. 427-54.
- Waweru, N.M., Hoque, Z. and Uliana, E. (2004), "Management accounting change in South Africa: case studies from retail services", *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 17 No. 5, pp. 675-704.
- Webb, R.A. (2004), "Managers' commitment to the goals contained in a strategic performance measurement system", *Contemporary Accounting Research*, Vol. 21 No. 4, pp. 925-58.
- Wouters, M. and Wilderom, C. (2008), "Developing performance-measurement systems as enabling formalization: a longitudinal field study of a logistics department", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 33 Nos 4/5, pp. 488-516.
- Yin, R.K. (1994), Case Study Research: Design and Methods, Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.
- Young, S.M. and Selto, F.H. (1991), "New manufacturing practices and cost management: a review of the literature and directions for research", *Journal of Accounting Literature*, Vol. 10, pp. 265-98.
- Zaltman, G., Duncan, R. and Holbek, J. (1973), Innovations and Organizations, Wiley, Toronto.

### Further reading

Maguire, S., Hardy, C. and Lawrence, T.B. (2004), "Institutional entrepreneurship in emerging fields: HIV/AIDS treatment advocacy in Canada", *Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 47 No. 5, pp. 657-79.

#### Corresponding author

Zahirul Hoque can be contacted at: z.hoque@latrobe.edu.au

To purchase reprints of this article please e-mail: reprints@emeraldinsight.com
Or visit our web site for further details: www.emeraldinsight.com/reprints



# Appendix. The attributes of management accounting innovations research articles

Management accounting innovations

537

Article title	Journal	Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method Key findings	Key findings
Accounting innovation and the psychology of change	TAR	Conceptual	People's reaction to change and how managers deal with resistance	No setting	No explicit theory	Conceptual	People's negative reaction is due to personal and group attitudes and organizational condition Overcoming resistance through preventive and coursiss actions
An examination of accounting interest groups' differential perceptions of innovations	TAR	Empirical	The extent to which differences occur among accounting interest aprops' perceptions of the need for and future rate of adoption of accounting innovations	Different accounting profession	Sociology	Survey	Accounting academics perceive a greater need for adoption and future rate of adoption of innovations. System effects are determinants of the rate of change. The system effects of accounting academics are oriented towards a greater need for change than those of CPAs and funantial asserting academics are oriented towards a greater need for change than those of CPAs and funancial asserting academics are diversity and accounting academics are oriented towards a greater need for CPAs and funancial asserting academics are diversity and accounting academics are accounting academics and accounting academics and accounting academics are accounting academics and accounting accou
The evolution of management accounting	TAR	Practical insights, review	The development of cost accounting and managerial control practices and their relevance to the changing nature of industrial competition in the 1980s	No setting	No explicit theory	Practical insights	Inflation Concurses  The traditional cost accounting model is no longer adequate for new organizations and manufacturing technology. Problems of using profits for each latting restferance
Management accounting lag	ABACUS Conceptual	Conceptual	Develops a framework to explain why changes in management accounting systems may have tended to lag behind changes in manufacturing operations	No setting	Sociology	Conceptual	A major cause of accounting lag in organizations is the perceived greater complexity and lesser relative advantage, compatibility, trialability, and observability of administrative (see technical) innovations (continued)

Table AI.

Management accounting innovations in general

Hicks (1978)

# 538

#### (continued) New techniques are being Developed perpetual MAI lag theory that suggests the disruptions to internal Suggests academics have involved in joint ventures management accounting system than those which adopted while traditional management accounting is in a transitional stage labor market operations with foreign firms made maintained; suggesting documented, elaborated organization caused by practices were initially close interaction with through publications. within a hierarchical Describes how these innovation adoption Chinese enterprises systems are being and disseminated more changes in MAIs may slow implementing organizations Research method Key findings Conceptual Practical insights Survey Survey organizational No explicit No explicit Sociology, Sociology behavior theory (joint venture) practitioners Survey to No setting The development of ABC, No setting Interorganisational Setting Trends in the adoption of accounting techniques by The causes of resistance Key issues addressed to MA innovation in manufacturing firms The diffusion of MA diffusion and factors spread of accounting practices, amount of associated with the operational control systems and BSC organizations hierarchical Article type Conceptual Empirical Empirical Practical insights, Journal JAEDAOSMARAOSManagement accounting: Management accounting procedures in the People's Republic of China and the (1984-1994): development management accounting partnered joint ventures managerial accounting making in-roads with Theory of perpetual influence of foreign of new practice and are new techniques innovation lag in The diffusion of organizations practitioners? hierarchical Article title theory Author/year Ward (1994) Firth (1996) Szendi and Foster and (1993)(1994)

Table AI.



Management
accounting
innovations

# 539

Author/year Article title Jon Libby and Predicting change in M	of 1	Journal	Article type Empirical	Article type Key issues addressed Empirical The extent of MACS	Setting Theory  Manufacturing Contingency	Theory	Research method Key findings Survey The MACS H	Key findings The MACS that support
ing prozes	NEW!	rambinear		change and its relationship between organizational and contextual variables	Manuacum	theory	Á3 A TINC	decision making and control changed more frequently than components that support planning or directing, or product costing Organizational size, structure, and intensity of competition did not predict changes in management accounting systems.
It is a small world of JMAR Empirical management accounting practices	JMAR	Empirical		The forces of convergence and divergence in management accounting practices around the world	Multiple industries	Sociology	Multiple methods	Prominent drivers of convergence include global competition, the application of advanced information system and software packages, transnational institutions, global consultancy industry, and globally applied textbooks
Unbundling management MAR Conceptual accounting innovations		Conceptual		Elements of management accounting models (ABM, BSC, life-cycle costing, target costing, and strategic management accounting) design by unbundling the models	No setting	Generic framework	Conceptual	The new models represent important changes in the type of elements or design characteristics that have been used previously (continued)

Table AI.



# **5**40

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method Key findings	Key findings
Reid and Smith (2000)	The impact of contingencies on management accounting system development	MAR	Empirical	Whether contingency theory is applicable to small firms as well as to large firms	Multiple industries (micro-firms)	Contingency	Multiple methods (interviews and survey)	Cash flow crisis, funding shortage, and innovation corresponded with information system development. Three firm types identified: adaptive, stagnant, and running blind. Production systems, technology uncertainty, strategy, and the market determine the organizational form of the small firm. MAS complexity is explained by sub-unit interdependence, market dependence, market dependence, market dependence, and work
Lin and Yu (2002)	Responsibility cost control system in China: a case of management accounting application	MAR	Case study	Why business enterprises Manufacturing Sociology in a developing country like China adopt imnovative accounting practices, and how these practices, and how these practices can be effectively applied under the specific Chinese business environment	Manufacturing	Sociology	Field study	methods The responsibility cost control system is an effective tool for cost control. Economic shock and performance gap are necessary conditions for the diffusion of such practices. The professional qualification of management teams and a balance between decentralization and centralization in business administration structure influence implementation success. (continued)

Table AI.



### 541

	Author/year Article title	Journal	Article type		Setting	Theory	Research method Key findings	Key findings
Implementing performance measurement innovations: evid from government from government	implementing performance neasurement innovations: evidence from government	AOS	Empirical	The factors influencing the implementation, use, and perceived benefits of resultsoriented performance measurement system	Public sector	Economics, sociology	Survey	Top management commitment, decision-making authority by users, and training have significant positive influences on measurement system development and use. The difficulties in selecting and interpreting performance metrics are the maior impediment
The diffusion of management acc innovations in the sector: a research	The diffusion of management accounting innovations in the public sector: a research agenda	MAR	Empirical	The manner and means of diffusion of MA practices in public sector and the obstacles to their adoption	Public sector	Sociology	Survey	MAIs are mainly originated in the private sector. Adoption by public sector organizations is largely affected by government influence.
Managen change in case stuc services	Management accounting change in south Africa: case studies from retail services	AAAJ	Case study	The processes of MAS change and the rationales for such change processes	Retailing	Contingency	Field study	Increased used of contemporary management accounting techniques. Increasing global competition and changes in technology affect management accounting change. Lack of resources, "no need for change" attitude and fear of change inhibit the change

### 542

Author/year Article title	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method Key findings	Key findings
Abernethy and Bouwens (2005)	Determinants of accounting innovation implementation	ABACUS	ABACUS Empirical	The determinants of accounting innovation	Manufacturing Contingency Survey theory	Contingency	Survey	A positive relation between the influence on management accounting systems design and decentralization. When subordinates are actively involved in designing and implementing these systems, acceptance is significantly increased
(2006)	Emsley et al. Effect of cognitive style and professional development on the initiation of radical and non-radical management accounting innovations	AF	Empirical	The effects of adaptive/ innovative cognitive style, and professional development on the initiation of radical and non-radical innovations by individual management accountants	Survey to management accountants	Psychology	Multiple methods (survey and interviews)	Management accountants with more innovative cognitive styles are more likely to initiate radical changes organizational practices. However, organizations should balance innovators and adaptors to balance addictal and non-radical changes

Management
accounting
innovations

## 543

Author/year Article		ournal A	be		Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
	TQM and the // choice of information and reward systems	JAR E	Empirical	The association between TQM, the choice of information and reward systems, and the impact of these choices on organizational performance	Manufacturing POM	POM	Survey	TQM is associated with greater use of non-traditional performance measures and reward systems. Less extensive formal quality program, greater reliance on non-traditional performance measures and reward systems are associated with higher (continued)

Table AII.
Total quality
management

QRAM
7,4

### **5**44

Key findings	Financial information can be used to flag quality problems, to select and prioritize quality improvement projects, and to choose corrective action. However, non-financial quality indicators are widely used because of good proxies for the financial impact, timelier, more reliable, and more reliable, and more	relevant Product quality and the implementation of environmental accounting significantly affect quality performance (continued)
Ke	E in This is a company of the compan	Pred in an Pred size of the pred size of
Research	Survey	Survey
Theory	No explicit theory	POM
Setting	Manufacturing No explicit theory	Manufacturing POM
Key issues addressed	The usefulness of cost of quality and quality related financial information for quality management	The extent of product quality and the implementation of environmental accounting positively affect quality performance
Journal Article type	Descriptive	AAA/ Empirical
Journa	AH	AAA)
Article title	Financial information and quality management – is there a role for accountants?	Product quality, environmental accounting and quality performance
Author/year	Sjoblom (1998)	Dunk (2002)

Table AII.

## 545

Author/year Article title	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Gurd <i>et al.</i> (2002)	Factors impacting on accounting lag: an exploratory study of responding to TQM	BAR	Descriptive	The responses of accounting systems to TQM implementations and factors that encourage or inhibit accounting lag following an innovation	Multiple industries	Organizational Multiple case behavior studies – assume site visit	Multiple case studies – assume site visit	Management commitment, strong leadership, education and training programs and customer focus reduce accounting lag, and fear of change will increase
Emsley (2008) Different interprets "fixed" or examinin cost of qu from an a network perspectif	Different interpretations of a "fixed" concept: examining Juran's cost of quality from an actornetwork perspective		AAAJ Case study	Why introducing a Manufacturing Sociology "fixed" management accounting technique, such as Juran's cost of quality, results in different outcomes in two manufacturing plants of an organization	Manufacturing	Sociology	Case study	The two plants developed Juran's cost of quality technique in significantly different ways

Table AII.



#### 546

Table AIII. Value-based management

Key findings	The measure network represents the relationship between a firm's business and management processes and estate-holders' moals	Economics Conceptual Value creation is commonly reified through its objectification, which prevents dispute and maintains social domination	Manufacturing Economics Case study Accounting metrics enable a process of translation and control with regard to realizing share price targets
	repressible to the name of the name of the name of the stakely	James James Jalue Teifiec Object dispur	dy Accou proces contro share
Research method	Concepti	Concept	Case stu
Theory	No explicit theory	Economics	Economics
Setting	Manufacturing	None	Manufacturing
Key issues addressed	Measuring the extent to which Manufacturing No explicit Conceptual The measure network a firm creates value for stakeholders using the measure network a firm's busin measure network	The process by which value creation is reified	The role of accounting calculations in constructing shareholder value within the context of OT in the work organization
Journal Article type	Conceptual	CPA Conceptual	Case study
Journal	CM	CPA	AOS
Article title	Using a measure network to CM Conceptual understand and deliver value	Bourguignon Management accounting and (2005) value creation: the profit and loss of reification	Ezzamel et al. Manufacturing shareholder (2008) value: the role of accounting in organizational transformation (OT)
Author/year Article title	Reilly and Reilly (2000)	Bourguignon (2005)	Ezzamel <i>et al.</i> (2008)

#### 547

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Banker and Potter (1993)	Economic implications of single cost driver systems	JMAR	Conceptual	The impacts of single and multiple cost driver systems on optimal expected profits of monopoly and oligonoly firms	Generic	Economics	Mathemati- cal analytic	Monopolist and oligopoly firms can expect higher profit using multiple cost driver system
Shields (1995)	An empirical analysis of firms' implementation experiences with ABC		JMAR Empirical	The degree of behavioral, organizational, and technical factors associated with the success of ABC implementation	Multiple industries (firms using ABC)	Contingency theory	Survey	Variation in the degree of success and financial benefit. Behavioral and organizational implementation variables are
Swenson (1995)	The benefits of activity-based cost management to the manufacturing industry	JMAR	Empirical, descriptive	The association between ABC implementation and manager's satisfaction with cost management systems. Also, how ABC is used for decision marking	Manufacturing	No explicit theory	Survey	Significant satisfaction with cost management systems following ABC implementation. Example of the use of ABC for decision
McGowan and Klammer (1997)	Satisfaction with activity-based JMAR cost management implementation	JMAR	Empirical	The association between employees' satisfaction with ABM implementation and behavioral, situational, and	Multiple industries (manufacturing and service)	Contingency theory	Survey	Behavioral, situational, and technical variables correlate positively with users' satisfaction with ABM
(1998)	The implementation stages of ABC and the impact of contextual and organizational factors	JMAR	Empirical	recultural valuable. The impact of contextual and organizational factors on ten stages of ABC implementation process	Manufacturing	Sociology	Survey	influenced by the firm's potential for cost distortions, firm size, and job shop. In general, top management support, training, and information technology are among the factors that affect the higher level of
(1998)	Perceived benefits of ABM implementation	AH	Empirical	Preparers' and users' perceptions on the benefits of ABM implementation	Multiple industries (manufacturing and service)	No explicit theory	Survey	implementation stages Greater benefits of ABM in terms of accounting information characteristics, but ABM information is less accessible. Preparers respond more favorably than users to ABM implementation (continued)

Table AIV. Activity-based costing/activity-based management

### 548

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Malmi (1999)	ABC diffusion across organizations: an exploratory empirical analysis of Finnish firms	AOS	Empirical	The forces of innovation diffusion in MA during its various phases. The applicability of Abrahamson's typology in MAI	Manufacturing	Sociology	Survey, archival, interviews	Efficient choice explains the earliest adoptions; fashionsetting influences the take-off stage. Subsequent diffusion is explained both by mimetic explained both by mimetic
Mishra and Vaysman (2001)	Cost-system choice and incentives – traditional vs ABC	JAR	Conceptual	The benefits of ABC relative to Generic traditional costing, considering information asymmetry, and managerial incontinger	Generic	Economics	Mathemati- cal analytic	Detaylor and enforcementation traditional costing method to owners due to information
Ittner <i>et al.</i> (2002)	The association between ABC and manufacturing performance	JMAR	JMAR Empirical	e of ABC ancial	Manufacturing	Economics	Survey	Extensive use of ABC associated with improvements in quality and cycle time, thus reducing manufacturing cost, but not in ROA
Sisaye (2003)	Process innovation and adaptive institutional change strategies in management control systems: ABC as administrative innovation	AMA	Conceptual	The process of diffusion of innovation, and how it impacts the successful adoption and implementation of MAIs	None	Organizational behavior	Conceptual	Process innovation framework: mechanistic, organic, organizational development (OD), and OT to understand MAI When ABC is integrated into OD or OT, the technical and administrative innovation aspects of ABC can be utilized to manage the operating
Brown et al. (2004)	Technological and organizational influences on the adoption of ABC in Australia	AF	Empirical	The organizational and technological factors that influence the initial adoption of ABC and movement through the stages of adoption	Multiple industries (manufacturing and service)	Sociology	Survey	Top management support, internal champion support, and organizational size influence the initiation of interest in ABC. Organizational factors (see technological factors) are the main drivers for progression through adoption decision stages.

Table AIV.



### 549

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research	Key findings
Chenhall (2004)	The role of cognitive and affective conflict in early implementation of activity-based cost management	BRIA	Empirical	The effect of the relationship between cognitive and effective conflicts with ABM behavioral implementation factors on the usefulness of ABM	Manufacturing	Organizational behavior and psychology	Survey	Association between ABM behavioral implementation factors and cognitive conflict affect beneficial outcomes
Agbejule (2006)	Motivation for ABC implementation: administrative and institutional influences	JAOC	Case study	How different motives for change may affect ABC implementation and determine the factors affecting implementation success at different stages in two business units (FMIT-H and FIMOT) of a company	Manufacturing	Sociology	Multiple case studies	The motivation for change is classified as overcive for FMIT-H, and normative and economic for FIMOT.  Management support, education, and information technology significantly affect different stages of implementation
Baird (2007)	Adoption of activity management practices in public sector organizations	AF	Descriptive, empirical	The extent of adoption of each level of activity management and the factors that affect the adoption	Public sector	Sociology	Survey	The adoption of activity cost analysis and ABC is less prevalent in the public sector, while the adoption of activity analysis is to the same extent as the private sector. Decision usefulness of cost information and size are associated with adoption
(2007)	The implementation of ABC in BAR China: an innovation action research approach		Innovation action research	Key success factors of ABC implementation	Manufacturing	Contingency	Action research	Top management support, top-down culture, hierarchical command, and communication structure, involvement of professionals identified as success factors for ABC implementation (continued)

Table AIV.



### **550**

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Al-Omiri and Drury (2007)	Organizational and behavioral CM factors influencing the adoption and success of ABC in the UK		Descriptive	The organizational and behavioral factors influencing the adoption and non-adoption of ABC and its success	Multiple industries	Contingency	Survey	Key influences on adoption are deficiencies of existing costing system and the changing environment; non-adoption is mainly related to the perceived benefits of ABC not justifying the cost of adoption. Major determinants of success are widespread support, adequate training, managers
Bhimani et al. (2007)	ABC: how far have we come internationally?	CM	Descriptive	The extent of ABC adoption in International Canada, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, the USA, and the UK	International	No explicit theory	Survey	uncer sentiming, aim nunwedge Significant difference in the rate, speed, extent, and perceived success of ABC implementation across
Kaplan and Anderson (2007)	The innovation of time-driven ABC	CM	Practical insight	How time-driven ABC overcomes the pitfalls of conventional ABC	Generic	No explicit theory	Practical insight	Countries ABC is easier and faster, and avoids the subjective activity of surveying tasks. It uses a time equation to drive cost directly
Alcouffe et al. (2008)	Alcouffe et al. Actor-networks and the diffusion of management accounting innovations: a comparative study	MAR	Case study	The diffusion of the Georges Perrin method and ABC in France	Specific country – France	Sociology	Archival, interviews	nonresources to cost objects Problematization, interessement, enrolment, and mobilization explain the processes of diffusion

Table AIV.



### 551

Research Theory method Key findings	Inter-organizational Sociology Longitudinal Trust constructs can reflect (retailers and suppliers) institutional phenomena (system trust) and personal and interpersonal forms of trust. The diffusion of category management was assisted by calculative practices that promote trustworthiness and enhanced system trust
Setting	
Journal Article type Key issues addressed	The relationship between trust and category management practice between a large UK retailer and a multinational supplier
Article type	Case study
Journal	AOS
uthor/year Article title	Walking the talk? Supply chain AOS Case study accounting and trust among UK supermarkets and suppliers
Author/year	Free (2008)

Table AV. Supply chain management

#### 552

es								
Author/ year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Kaplan (1983)	Measuring manufacturing performance: a new challenge for managerial accounting research	TAR	Conceptual	Why American manufacturing is being outpaced by foreign firms	None	No explicit theory	Conceptual	Suggests more flexible measurements to manage manufacturing processes of quality, inventory cost, productivity, new product technologies, discounted cash flows, and incentive schemes and incentive schemes
Banker et al. (1993)	Reporting manufacturing performance measures to workers: an empirical study	JMAR	Empirical	Whether the choice of manufacturing performance reporting system is influenced by firm's manufacturing practices	Manufacturing	Organizational behavior	Survey	Reporting of manufacturing performance measures to shop floor workers positively related to the implementation of JIT, TQM, and teamwork practices. Employee morale positively related to JIT, TQM, and teamwork practices and the provision of shop floor performance information
Itmer and Larcker (1998b)	Innovations in performance measurement: trends and research implications	JMAR	Review, descriptive	Research on emerging performance measurement practices	None	No explicit theory	Literature review, archival	Research on the use and performance consequences of EVA, non-financial performance measures and BSC, and performance measurement initiatives in government agencies. Suggests directions for future research (continued)

Table AVI. Organisational/ Manufacturing performance measures

#### 553

Theory Research method Key findings	Economics and Archival Customer satisfaction POM measures are positively associated with future accounting performance and economically relevant to the stock market; reflected partially in current	No explicit Longitudinal case study Performance measures theory agency	Sociology Case study The influence of institutional forces: economic constraints, regulatory control, accounting standards or legislation, management's strategic focus, bank size, competition, and organizational tendency to copy best practices	No explicit Survey JIT firms use more non- theory financial performance measures and reward system. They use more TQM measurement tools
Setting Th	Telecommunication Εα	Government No agency the		Manufacturing No
Key issues addressed	The value relevance of customer satisfaction	How performance measurement is used in government agency	How institutional factors Service (Banking) influence the design and use of non-financial performance measurement systems in four Japanese banks	The differences in the performance measurement and reward systems in JIT and non-JIT firms
Journal Article type	Empirical	Case study	Case study, descriptive	Descriptive, empirical
Journal	JAR	CM	AAAJ	CM
Article title	Are nonfinancial measures leading indicators of financial performance? An analysis of customer satisfaction	The evolution of performance measurement in government	Understanding non- financial performance measurement practices in Japanese banks: a new institutional sociology perspective	Performance measurement and reward systems in JIT and non-JIT firms
Author/ year	Ittner and Larcker (1998a)	Thor (2000)	Hussain and Hoque (2002)	Fullerton (2003)

<b>QRAM</b>
7,4

#### **554**

Author/ year Article title Journ Said et al. An empirical JMAI (2003) investigation of the performance consequences of nonfinancial measures						
al. An empirical investigation of the performance consequences of nonfinancial measures	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
	JMAR Empirical	The implications of non-Multiple industries financial performance measures being included in compensation contracts, and the fit with operational and competitive factors	Multiple industries	Economics and Archival contingency theory	Archival	Financial and non- financial measures lead to higher ROA and market returns. Non- financial measures are associated with innovation-oriented and quality-oriented strategies, length of the product development cycle, industry regulation, and level of financial distress. Association between non-financial measures use and firm performance is contingent on firm's operational and
Cote and Relationship quality: a AMA Latham critical link in (2004) management accounting performance measurement systems	4A Conceptual	To build a model that links the quality of interorganizational relationships to financial and non-financial outcomes	Generic	POM and organizational behavior	Conceptual	competitive characteristics A model of relationship quality that incorporates relationship constructs that drive a series of financial and non-financial performance outcomes. The mediating variables in the model are commitment and trust



## 555

Author/ year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Ullrich and Tutfle (2004)	The effects of comprehensive information reporting systems and economic incentives on managers' time-planning decisions	BRIA	Experimental	Experimental How comprehensive control systems influence managers as they allocate their time among multiple areas of responsibility	Generic	Economics	Experiment	Subjects planned to spend more time working on non-financial areas and less time on the financial area when reporting multiple areas of performance. Incentives tied to achieving goals in all areas
Webb (2004)	Managers' commitment to the goals contained in a strategic performance measurement system	CAR	Experimental	Experimental The effect of perceived cause-effect strength of SPMS on managerial commitment to assigned performance goals	Service (financial service)	Organisational Experiment behavior	Experiment	an areas  Ossitive impact of SPMS on goal commitment. Impact of SPMS on goal commitment mediated by manager's self- efficacy and goal
Liedtka (2005)	Analytic hierarchy process and multi- criteria performance management systems	CM	Practical insight, case study	How AHP is applied in designing and implementing performance measures	Airline	No explicit theory	Case study	autactiveness Four techniques in implementing the AHP. The AHP-based performance scores correlate highest with annual stock market return, indicating that it links strategy to shareholder wealth most accurately



### 556

Author/ year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Maiga and Jacobs (2005)	Antecedents and consequences of quality performance	BRIA	Empirical	The influence of MCS on Manufacturing quality performance, and consequently on financial performance and customer satisfaction	Manufacturing	Economics and organizational behavior	Survey	MCS factors associated with quality performance. Quality performance is: positively associated with financial performance and customer satisfaction;
Bouwens and van Lent (2006)	Performance measure properties and the effect of incentive contracts	JMAR	JMAR Empirical	How performance measure properties and cash bonuses impact the efficacy of incentive contracts in selecting a qualified workforce and motivating employees to	Multiple industries Economics	Economics	Survey – by third party	and mediates the relationship between MCS, performance, and customer satisfaction Less noisy or distorted performance measures and higher cash bonuses are associated with improved employee selection and better-directed effort
Van der Stede <i>et al.</i> (2006)	Strategy, choice of performance measures, and performance	BRIA	Empirical	provide goal-congruent effort The relationship between quality-based manufacturing strategy and the use of different types of performance measures	Manufacturing	Contingency	Survey	Objective and subjective non-financial measures associated with higher firm performance. Quality-based strategies firms use more objective non-financial measures and firmatial measures and
								have higher performance when using more extensive PMS based on subjective measures (continued)



#### 557

Author/ year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Verbeteen (2008)	Verbeteen Performance management practices in public sector organizations: impact on performance		AAA/ Empirical	Whether performance management practices affect performance in public sector organizations	Public sector organization	Economics and Survey organizational behavior	Survey	Defining clear and measurable goals is positively associated with both quantity performance (efficiency, production targets) and quality performance (accuracy, innovation
Wouters and Wilderom (2008)	Developing performance measurement systems as enabling formalization: a longitudinal field study of a logistics department	AOS	Case study, empirical	How the development process of designing and implementing a performance-measurement system affects the extent to which the PMS will be perceived by employees as enabling	Manufacturing	Sociology	Field study (longitudinal Building on existing case study, action performance-research, and survey) of employees, their professionalism, and allowing experimentation with measures contribute the enabling nature of PMS	employee morale) Building on existing performance- measurement experience of employees, their professionalism, and allowing experimentation with measures contribute to the enabling nature of a PMS



#### 558

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Itmer et al. (1997)	The choice of performance measures in annual business contracts	TAR	Empirical	The factors influencing the relative weights placed on financial and non-financial performance measures in CEO bonus contracts	Multiple industries	Economics	Archival	Use of non-financial measures increases with the level of regulation, the extent to which a firm follows an innovation-oriented strategy, the adoption of strategic quality initiatives, and the noise in financial
Ezzamel and Willmott (1998)	Accounting, remuneration, and employee motivation in the new organization	ABR	Case study	The role of accounting in developing remuneration systems in management practices change (delayering and multiskilling, team working, and employee	Manufacturing	Organizational behavior	Case studies	massures In the event of organizational change, accounting was deployed to discredit an earlier reward system and facilitate launching of a new reward system
Banker <i>et al.</i> (2000)	An empirical investigation of an incentive plan that includes nonfinancial performance measures	TAR	Empirical	Unipower undering which the root in the ro	Service (hotel)	Economics	Archival	Customer-satisfaction measures are associated with business unit revenues and operating profit, but not with operating costs. Incentive plans that include non-financial measures improve financial and
Datar et al. (2001)	Balancing performance measures	JAR	Conceptual	The optimal weights to apply to performance measures in a compensation contract	Generic	Economics	Mathematical analytic	non-inancial measures. The optimal contract weights of performance measures to maximize congruity between an agent's compensation and a firm's outcomes a firm's outcomes

**Table AVII.** Employee performance measures



### 559

	ems ppment ational ersonal	t nance so for sures.	across all cludating dajor arket arket inancial congruence. ens is mrs is privatived)
Key findings	Gain-sharing systems support the development of continuous improvement and encourage organizational trust, but inhibit personal trust.	The outcome effect increased with the controllability of a manager's performance measure, and more so for non-financial measures. Controllability assessment of outcome measures prior to actual	evatuation reduced the outcome effect across all measures. Criteria for evaluating measurement alternatives. Major limitation of market measures is controllability, whereas for summary financial measures it is congruence. The quality of combinations of measures systems is potentially highly varied continued) (continued)
Research method	Field study (case study and archival)	Experiment	Literature review
Theory	Psychology and sociology	Economics	Sociology, economics and organizational behavior
Setting	Manufacturing	Retailing	None
Key issues addressed	The history of strategic change and the development of performance measurement and gainsharing reward system	Experimental Whether the degree of outcome effect using financial and non-financial performance measures is dependent on measures' controllability	How to choose a measure pur set of measures for the purposes of evaluating and rewarding general managers' performance
Journal Article type	Case study	Experimental	Review
Journal	JMAR	BRIA	AAAJ Review
Article title	Performance measurement and reward systems, trust, and strategic change	Alternative measures of managers' performance, controllability, and the outcome effect	Measuring general managers' performances: market, accounting and combination-of-measures systems
Author/year	Chenhall and Langfield- Smith (2003)	Ghosh (2005)	Merchant (2006)

### **560**

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Burney and Widener (2007)	Strategic performance measurement systems, JRI, and managerial behavioral responses – role stress and performance	BRIA	Empirical	The relation between an SPMS and individual behavioral responses. [RI (i.e. RA and role conflict)	Multiple industries (survey on managers)	Economics and organizational behavior	Survey	SPMS positively affects performance through its relations with JRI and RA. When SPMS is closely linked to strategy, higher levels of JRI and lower levels of role conflict and RA are observed. Performance is higher Performance is higher when PA is lower
Kachelmeier et al. (2008)	Measuring and motivating quantity, creativity or both	JAR	Experiment	The effects of performance-based compensation schemes that are contingent on explicit measures of quantity, creativity, or both	Generic	Economics	Experiment	water a state of the combining quantity and creativity weighted pay scheme results in creativity-weighted productivity-weighted productivity scores significantly lower than our onthity incontines a long manufity incontines.
Kennedy and Schleifer (2007)	Team performance measurement: a system to balance innovation and empowerment with control	AMA	Conceptual	The influence of performance measurement on innovation. Propose a team measurement system that seeks to balance innovation and empowerment with control	Generic	Organizational behavior	Conceptual	Assessment of TPMS impact on imovation and empowerment Four categories of metrics in the TPMS framework provide a broad view of team performance: financial measures, operational measures, project effectiveness index, and team effectiveness index, and team effectiveness index.



### 561

nthor/year Article title		Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed Setting	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
nn (2007)	Financial consequences in EAR Empirical foreign subsidiary manager performance evaluations	EAR	Empirical	Financial impacts of using multiple forms of controls in managerial performance evaluations	Multi-nationals Organizational (manufacturing) behavior and sociology	Organizational behavior and sociology	Survey, archival	Emphasis on financial controls inproves short-term profitability more than non-financial or behavioral controls, and is even higher than simultaneous emphasis of all controls. Perceived environmental changes moderate the relationship between emphasis on non-financial controls and short-term profitability

## 562

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
Kaplan and Norton (2001)	Transforming the BSC from performance measurement to strategic part 1	AH	Conceptual	BSC framework for describing value-creating strategies that link intangible and tangible	Generic	Strategic management	Conceptual	Developing strategy map and applying BSC in non-profit and government organizations
Malina and Selto (2001)	Communicating and controlling strategy: an empirical study of the effectiveness of the BSC	JMAR	Empirical, descriptive	Whether BSC is an effective organizational communication and management control device, and causally related to goal alignment, motivation, and reported process or decision changes	Manufacturing	Organizational Archivat, behavior	Archival, survey	BSC is an effective approach for strategy communication and management control. Improvement in BSC's performance may improve business efficiency and profitability. However, inaccurate or subjective measures, one-way communication and an inappropriate benchmark cause significant conflicts and thensons between a company
Lyons et al. (2003)	Aligning capital investment decisions with the BSC	CM	Case study	How BSC was used to translate Health care strategy into actions and how BSC was linked to capital budgeting process	Health care	No explicit theory	Case study	and its distributions  Capital investment decision making was integrated into BSC using a matrix approach. Strategic goals were assigned weights and projects were evaluated based on their
Ax and Bjørnenak (2005)	Bundling and diffusion of management accounting innovations – the case of the BSC in Sweden	MAR	Descriptive	Communication, diffusion and transformation of BSC from a supply side perspective	None	Sociology	Archival	goals BSC has been supplemented with other administrative innovations and adapted to the existing business culture to appear more attractive. The Swedish BSC package includes BSC and non-budget management, BSC and the intellectual capital model, and BSC and the stakeholder model BSC and the stakeholder model

**Table AVIII.**Balanced scorecard



## 563

$\triangleleft$	Author/year Article title	Journal	Journal Article type	Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research	Key findings
L 3 O G S	The interplay of different levers of control: a case study of introducing a new performance measurement system	MAR	Case study	The role of strategic performance measurement systems in the interplay between different control levers	Manufacturing Simons' levers of control		Field	The 3K scorecard was used for both diagnostic and interactive control purposes at the case company and had specific implications for both beliefs systems and boundary
	Balancing dilemmas of the BSC	AAAJ	AAAJ Conceptual	Debate on critical issues in the None implementation and use of the BSC as a management control tool	None	Organizational Conceptual behavior	Conceptual	The dilemma of balancing different perspectives in implementation and employee mobilization, one-size-fits-all problems, the time dimension, and various organizational logics.
	The BSC equates interests in healthcare organizations	JAOC	Case study	How BSC has been translated and edited to fit the public healthcare environment. How politicians, administrators, and medical professionals have influenced the design and function of the BSC	Public sector	Sociology	Case study	Concept of balance was translated as a balance between different perspectives, resulting in the BSC balancing the different interests within the organization. The cause and effect relationship is ineffective in the context studied
, <u> </u>	A rationale for stakeholder- based management in developing nations	JAOC	Case study and conceptual	The rationale for stakeholder- based management in developing countries, whether based on agency theory or stakeholder theory	Manufacturing Economics, sociology	Economics, sociology	Case study	Stakeholder-based management strategy is implemented using BSC and strategy map. It proves consistent with normative stakeholder theory, resulting in "foral wealth creation", rather than just "shareholder wealth"

564

discusses antecedent, contextual, and outcome variables. Applies it to illustrate the benchmarking of an ABC management system Contingency Conceptual Develops a framework for theory Key findings Research method Setting Theory The roles benchmarking plays within management accounting functions Journal Article type Key issues addressed JMAR Conceptual Benchmarking and management accounting: a framework for research Author/year Article title Elnathan et al. (1996)

**Table AIX.** Benchmarking



### 565

Author/year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Key findings
T u u u u a u	The relationship between strategic priorities, management techniques and management accounting; an empirical investigation using a systems approach	AOS	Empirical	Whether combinations of management techniques and practices enhance the performance of organizations under particular strategic priorities particular strategic priorities	Manufacturing Strategic managem contingen	Strategic management and contingency theory	Survey	Quality systems, integrating systems, team-based structures and human resource management policies, improving processes, manufacturing systems innovations, and activity-based techniques enhance performance of firms emphasizing product differentiation strategies. Integrating systems, benchmarking, strategic planning techniques and activity-based techniques
H S S III	Naranjo-Gil and How top management teams JMAR Hartnann (TMTs) use management (2006) accounting systems to implement strategy	JMAR	Empirical	How TMTs use management accounting systems for strategy implementation	Public hospitals	Organizational behavior	Survey	enhance organizational performance in low price strategies As TMTs have a more professional (administrative) orientation, they make more interactive (diagnostic) use of MAS, and the use of non- financial (financial) information (continued)

**Table AX.** Strategic management accounting

### 566

r/year	Article title	Journal	Article type	Journal Article type Key issues addressed	Setting	Theory	Research method	Research method Key findings
and (2008)	An exploratory investigation of an integrated contingency model of strategic management accounting	AOS	AOS Empirical	The effect of strategic choices, market orientation, and company size on two dimensions of SMA and the mediating effect of SMA on company performance	Multiple	Contingency theory	Survey, archival	Contingency theory Survey, Accountants' strategic archival decision-making participation is positively associated with the use of a prospector strategy and deliberate strategy and deliberate strategy formulation. SMA use is positively associated with using a prospector strategy, deliberate strategy formulation, company size, and accountants' strategic decision-making participation. SMA usage positively affects

Table AX.

567

1	ct, ools
Research method Key findings	Practical Steps involved are related to top insight management support, pilot project, planning, form teams, training, tools set up, and institutionalization process
Research method	Practical insight
Theory r	y No explicit theory
	Manufacturing No explicit theory
Key issues addressed Setting	Practical insight Processes and steps to implement target costing
Journal Article type	Practical insight
Journal	СМ
.uthor/ Year Article Title	A template for implementing target costing
Author/ Year	Ansari <i>et al.</i> (2007)

Table AXI.
Target costing

## 568

Journal Article type Key issues addressed Setting
Practical insight
Case study

**Table AXII.**Lean manufacturing



Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.